HUMAN TRAFFICKING

Manual for
Lecturers and Students
HUMAN TRAFFICKING

Manual for Lecturers and Students

Recommended by the Minister of Education and Science of the Republic of Armenia as a supplemental manual for teachers and students of higher educational institutions

Yerevan
2013
Prepared for publication by the IOM Project Development and Implementation Unit in Armenia

This manual was published within the framework of the IOM Regional Project “Slidifying Awareness on Trafficking in Persons in Armenia, Azerbaijan and Georgia through Education” with funding from the Swiss Agency for Development and Cooperation (SDC).

The opinions expressed in the manual do not necessarily reflect the views and official policies of the International Organization for Migration, its Member States, or the SDC.

The opinions expressed in the report are those of the authors and do not necessarily reflect the views of the International Organization for Migration (IOM). The designations employed and the presentation of material throughout the report do not imply the expression of any opinion whatsoever on the part of IOM concerning the legal status of any country, territory, city or area, or of its authorities, or concerning its frontiers or boundaries.

IOM is committed to the principle that humane and orderly migration benefits migrants and society. As an intergovernmental organization, IOM acts with its partners in the international community to: assist in meeting the operational challenges of migration; advance understanding of migration issues; encourage social and economic development through migration; and uphold the human dignity and well-being of migrants.

Publisher: International Organization for Migration
Mission in Armenia
14 Petros Adamyan Street, UN House, Yerevan 0010, Armenia
Telephone: (+374 10) 58 56 92, 58 37 86, 54 56 92, 52 56 92
Facsimile: (+374 10) 54 33 65
Email: IOMArmenia@iom.int
URL: http://www.iom.int/armenia

© 2013 International Organization for Migration (IOM)

All rights reserved. No part of this publication may be reproduced, stored in a retrieval system, or transmitted in any form or by any means, electronic, mechanical, photocopying, recording, or otherwise without the prior written permission of the publisher.
Dear students and lecturers,

This manual has been prepared with the mission to inform the general public about human trafficking and to prevent the rates and consequences of this crime, which is coming under growing global scrutiny.

This manual was published within the framework of the regional “Solidifying Awareness on Trafficking in Persons in Armenia, Azerbaijan and Georgia through Education” programme implemented by the International Organization for Migration (IOM). It is aimed at sustaining the regional “Secondary School Education in Armenia, Azerbaijan and Georgia to Contribute to the Prevention of Trafficking in Persons” programme, which has produced similar manuals for teachers, students and their parents. This manual is intended for students and lecturers of higher educational institutions.

This manual is made up of two chapters with two topic sub-sections. It is not aimed at providing exhaustive information on human trafficking – this sort of information can be obtained from other sources referenced within the manual; instead, its key objective is to provide teachers and educators with the opportunity to become more aware of human trafficking issues, prevent any potential incidence of human trafficking among their students, and promote the relatively smooth social integration of trafficking victims into regular life.

This manual puts forward some research topics which could be of use for further study, for example theses and scientific papers. The authors encourage a comparative approach and urge the reader to examine the issue of trafficking from a multi-disciplinary perspective. The manual raises many topics for discussion which still lack definite answers; such questions remain open and can be answered only through public debate. Studying this problem is essential both for education and mass media, so that reports on human trafficking never fuel intolerance and prejudice against victims, but rather create opportunities for victims’ rehabilitation and smooth social re-integration.

This manual can be instructive for sociologists, educators, journalists, psychologists and other professionals who deal with human trafficking issues.

We wish you success in your endeavours.
CHAPTER 1. THE NATURE OF HUMAN TRAFFICKING AND THE EXTREME DANGER IT POSES TO SOCIETY.........................6

TOPIC 1. WHAT IS HUMAN TRAFFICKING?.................................................9
A. The concept of “human trafficking”...............................................9
B. The Protocol to Prevent, Suppress and Punish Trafficking in Persons, Especially Women and Children........................................11
C. The Council of Europe Convention on Action against Trafficking in Human Beings........................................15
D. Human trafficking as considered under international law..............17
E. Elements of crime of trafficking in persons stipulated in the Criminal Code of the Republic of Armenia..........................21
F. Anti-trafficking action in the Republic of Armenia..........................28

TOPIC 2. CAUSES AND FACTORS LEADING TO HUMAN TRAFFICKING........................................................................32
A. Economic globalization.................................................................32
B. Economic and legal differences of states and regions....................33
C. Human organ and tissue transplantation as a result of scientific progress in medicine..................................................35
D. The concept of victim behaviour................................................35

CHAPTER 2. ANTI-TRAFFICKING ACTIONS.............................................39

TOPIC 1. PREVENTION OF HUMAN TRAFFICKING..........................40
A. The concept of prevention of human trafficking..........................40
B. Preventive measures against trafficking in persons.......................41
C. Youth as a risk group for trafficking...........................................46
D. Cooperation in anti-trafficking actions........................................48
E. Practical guidelines.......................................................................50

TOPIC 2. SUPPORT AND PROTECTION OF TRAFFICKING VICTIMS............................................................................54

METHODODOLOGICAL GUIDE..................................................................59
JIGSAW METHOD.....................................................................................59
CASE STUDY.............................................................................................63
CHAPTER 1. THE NATURE OF HUMAN TRAFFICKING AND THE EXTREME DANGER IT POSES TO SOCIETY

In the 1990s, social studies experts first spoke of globalization in social processes, saying that the world had become ‘a smaller place’ with former local processes nowadays ‘freely’ crossing national borders, continents and even oceans. Modern society can indeed be described as globalized since frontiers have gradually become more transparent in terms of the circulation of ideas, funds, commodities and people. However, modern society is not only witnessing the fruits of human progress as a result of globalization, but also its problems. Globalization has been a trigger for increased organized crime, with criminal networks exerting manipulative influence on the economic, political and cultural level as a result of these newly-established global relations and the information technology revolution. Human trafficking is one of the gravest concerns accompanying globalization.

Indeed, human trafficking is often referred to as “modern-/present-day slavery”, based on the fact that human beings are regarded as articles of trade. Armenia is predominantly a country of origin, that is to say a ‘supplier’ of potential victims for trafficking. However, there have been some incidents involving foreigners who became victims of trafficking in Armenia, \(^1\) as well as a few cases of internal trafficking.\(^2\) Multiple cases regarding labour and sexual exploitation against Armenian women, men and children in other countries have come to light. Therefore, Armenian society should be made more aware of human trafficking to reduce the number of potential victims and avoid using products and services provided by trafficked persons. By using these products people can unintentionally promote trafficking.

In Armenia, people identified as victims of trafficking are frequently those who wish to escape their harsh living conditions. In their

---

1 Particularly exotic dancers from other countries to perform in local night clubs.
2 *Solstice* by V. Harutyunyan tells a real-life story on how a young boy falls victim to trafficking in Yerevan and finds himself in a situation similar to slavery.
haste and desperation they agree to leave the country and naively believe in the empty promises of easy and quick income. Consequently, they often find themselves in perilous situations, as they are exposed to ruthless physical and moral abuse and forced to do unpaid hard work which exceeds their capacity, as well as subjected to beatings, threats and humiliation.

According to the standards currently applied to eliminate human trafficking, Armenia is categorized under Tier 1.³ Tier 1 includes countries the governments of which fully comply with the minimum standards for the elimination of trafficking.

“Armenia is a source country for men, women, and children subjected to forced labor and sex trafficking; sex and labor trafficking within the country is also a problem. Women and girls from Armenia are subjected to sex trafficking within the country and in the United Arab Emirates and Turkey. Armenian men and women are subjected to forced labor in Russia and Turkey. Armenian men incur debt to pay for travel expenses; this may contribute to their subsequent victimization in destination countries. Their labor recruitment is organized by family members, close acquaintances, and legal but unlicensed private employment agencies. Isolated cases were reported of Armenian boys subjected to forced labor within the country. Some children work in agriculture, construction, and service provision within the country and some children serve as domestic workers in Armenia and Turkey. Russian and Ukrainian dancers in Armenian nightclubs may be vulnerable to trafficking. Child abuse victims and minors departing from child care institutions are particularly vulnerable to human trafficking”- is written in the Report.

The problem of human trafficking has become serious concern for all humanity. While states cooperate in their efforts to combat trafficking, this “modern-day slavery” persists. Despite the lack of any accurate data, different sources suggest that there is an estimated total of 2.5 to 4 million victims of trafficking a year⁴.

³ For details see the 2013 U.S. State Department Trafficking in Persons Report: http://www.state.gov/j/tip/rls/tiprpt/2013/
⁴ МОТ, Глобальный альянс против принудительного труда, 2005. С. 46.
Additionally, it is estimated that the annual profits accrued through human trafficking amount to billions.\(^5\)

The period following World War II marked a new milestone in human rights protection, as human life was proclaimed a supreme value along with the fundamental and inalienable rights and freedoms of the person. Democratic countries embarked on a mission to become guarantors of human rights protection. Many countries signed up to the *Universal Declaration of Human Rights* in the hope that social development would eradicate human exploitation and other forms of degrading treatment and punishment.

Despite these efforts, it is clear today that there is still much to be done in order to create a world without violence and infringements of human rights. To counter a new global wave of human trafficking and for servitude, labour and sexual exploitation, removal and sale of organs, and many other purposes, a decision was made by affected states to take more coordinated and concerted action against this modern form of slavery, namely tackling transnational organized crime, which leads to violations of rights to life, health, safety, personal immunity, dignity, adequate remuneration for work, and a number of other fundamental and inalienable rights.

TOPIC 1. WHAT IS HUMAN TRAFFICKING?6

A. The concept of “human trafficking”

The concept of “human trafficking” means the recruitment, transportation, transfer, harbouring or receipt of persons, by means of the threat or use of force or other forms of coercion, of abduction, of fraud, of deception, of the abuse of power or of a position of vulnerability, and of the giving or receiving of payments or benefits to achieve the consent of a person having control over another person for the purpose of exploitation.7

Here are some examples of human exploitation characteristic of the phenomena described above:

- Mr. V. recruited a group of men to work on construction sites and transferred them to the Russian Federation. These persons were subjected to coercion; they were forced to work, and the sums payable to them were embezzled by Mr. V. and his criminal associates.
- Mrs. M. was engaged in prostitution in her hometown. She agreed to leave for country Y, taken in by the recruiter’s promise of double income for her “work”. However, Mrs. M. worked twice as much but was not paid, since her money went into the pockets of pimps and their associates, who had seized her identification papers.

Human exploitation has a long, ugly history. The oldest form of human exploitation is slavery. The exploitation and sale of slaves as articles of trade was considered common practice in ancient Greece or Rome. A possible reason for this was the fact that people did not see much difference between their domestic animals and slaves. Slaves were denied the right to privacy and property and, what is more, they were passed under the ownership of their masters. As time went by, people abolished

7 The concept was defined in the Protocol to Prevent, Suppress and Punish Trafficking in Persons, Especially Women and Children, supplementing the United Nations Convention against Transnational Organized Crime signed on 12 December 2000 in Palermo.
slavery as slaves’ work was not based on their own motivation and gradually grew unprofitable, thereby making the slave owners find new ways to enhance slaves’ motivation. To this end, they gradually emancipated their slaves, gave them some land with the right to ownership and thereby tried to promote the efficiency of their labour. It is also well-known that in ancient times the need for warriors made many sovereigns prohibit debt bondage of free citizens – a record of this is found in the code of Hammurabi.

The second stage of slavery concerns racial discrimination, when white-skinned humans considered themselves superior and began to enslave those of other skin colours, namely black. This process unfolded during the exploration of the American and African continents and persisted until the late 19th century despite strong condemnation from humanist thinkers, who argued that all races belonged to the same species of “homo sapiens” and that humans should not be exploited by one another.

In 1815, the Declaration of the Congress of Vienna was the first international instrument to condemn slavery and to ban the trade in black African slaves. Later, in 1818, the Conference of Aix-la-Chapelle (Aachen) banned the trade in black slaves and declared it a criminal offence. However, both instruments remained on paper rather than in practice. Since these landmark agreements, more vigorous action has been taken against the slave trade, yet slavery or similar practices of human trafficking continue to exist.8

Unfortunately, it cannot be argued that society has been free of slavery at any stage of civilization – many people have always been exposed to some form of bondage. Sexual exploitation was very common in Oriental countries: the majority of women held in harems were, in fact, enslaved.

However, there is one fundamental difference between the classical concept of slavery and modern forms of exploitation. While in the past, slave owners openly showed off their slaves and boasting about their number and their abilities, nowadays “slave owners”

seek to hide their slaves at all costs because of the illegitimacy of human trafficking. They usually hide their victims from the public eye, and keep them in underground accommodation or so-called “labor camps” in rural, sparsely populated areas. If victims are exploited in the capacity of domestic servants, traffickers simply hide the fact that they are kept in slavery – the victims work without remuneration or days off and are exposed to beatings and threats. Unfortunately, human trafficking exists with the tacit agreement and collaboration with competent authorities, who turn a blind eye to violations in hotels, homes or on construction sites, and to obviously forged documents at border check points, for instance, when girls aged between 15 and 20 are “officially” 30 on their documents.

At present human trafficking and exploitation is not just a problem for certain countries and can be found in all countries, rich and poor. Victims of trafficking suffer physical, mental and material damage which takes great effort and a long time to heal, and which makes their reintegration into society painful and difficult. Effective action to prevent and combat human trafficking in women, men and children requires a holistic international approach in the countries of origin, transit and destination. Such an approach would cover measures to prevent trafficking, punish traffickers and protect victims, and by also promoting victims’ internationally recognized human rights.

B. The Protocol to Prevent, Suppress and Punish Trafficking in Persons, Especially Women and Children

Taking into account the need for a universal instrument providing for practical measures to combat exploitation of persons, especially women and children, as well as ensuring adequate protection for persons vulnerable to trafficking, the Protocol to Prevent, Suppress and Punish Trafficking in Persons, Especially Women and Children, supplementing the United Nations Convention against Transnational Organized Crime was signed on 12th December 2000 in Palermo. It should be emphasized that this type of crime is
transnational in nature; this is evident from the contents of the Article 3 of the United Nations *Convention against Transnational Organized Crime* of 12\textsuperscript{th} December 2000 which reads as follows:

“An offence is transnational in nature if:
(a) It is committed in more than one State;
(b) It is committed in one State but a substantial part of its preparation, planning, direction or control takes place in another State;
(c) It is committed in one State but involves an organized criminal group that engages in criminal activities in more than one State; or
(d) It is committed in one State but has substantial effects in another State.”

The Protocol to Prevent, Suppress and Punish Trafficking in Persons, Especially Women and Children was signed by the Republic of Armenia on November 15\textsuperscript{th} 2001 and ratified on July 1\textsuperscript{st} 2003. The purposes of this Protocol are:

“(a) To prevent and combat trafficking in persons, paying particular attention to women and children;
(b) To protect and assist the victims of such trafficking, with full respect for their human rights; and
(c) To promote cooperation among States Parties in order to meet these objectives.”

Article 3 of the Protocol defines the concept of trafficking in persons:

“For the purposes of this Protocol:

(a) “Trafficking in persons” shall mean the recruitment, transportation, transfer, harbouring or receipt of persons, by means of the threat or use of force or other forms of coercion, of abduction, of fraud, of deception, of the abuse of power or of a position of vulnerability or of the giving or receiving of payments or benefits to achieve the consent of a person having control over another person, for the
purpose of exploitation. Exploitation shall include, at a minimum, the exploitation of the prostitution of others or other forms of sexual exploitation, forced labo[u]r or services, slavery or practices similar to slavery, servitude or the removal of organs;

(b) The consent of a victim of trafficking in persons to the intended exploitation set forth in subparagraph (a) of this article shall be irrelevant where any of the means set forth in subparagraph (a) have been used;

(c) The recruitment, transportation, transfer, harbo[u]ring or receipt of a child for the purpose of exploitation shall be considered “trafficking in persons” even if this does not involve any of the means set forth in subparagraph (a) of this article;

(d) “Child” shall mean any person less than eighteen years of age.”

Trafficking in persons involves three key elements:

1. Action: recruitment, transportation, transfer, harbouring or receipt of persons.

2. Means: threat or use of force or other forms of coercion, abduction, fraud, deception, abuse of power or vulnerable position or of the giving or receiving of payments or benefits to achieve the consent of a person having control over another person.

3. Purpose: Exploitation shall include, at a minimum, exploitation of prostitution of others or other forms of sexual exploitation, forced labour or services, slavery or practices similar to slavery, servitude or the removal of organs.

The following table will facilitate understanding the definition of human trafficking.9

---

9 The table was supplemented on the basis of the table presented on page 14 of the How to steer anti-trafficking combat in communities manual written by Melkonyan and published by IOM in 2006.
Traffickers take the following actions for the purposes of exploitation:
- Recruitment
- Transportation
- Transfer
- Harboung
- Receiving

The primary objective of trafficking is exploitation, which can take the following forms:
- Exploitation of people to engage them in prostitution
- Other forms of sexual exploitation (e.g. pornography)
- Forced labour or services
- Slavery or practices similar to slavery
- Slave toil
- Removal of organs

Trafficking in persons is a combination of three elements outlined above rather than their individual occurrence. For instance, “harbouring” people (action), which includes “threat or use of force” (means) for the purpose of “forced labour” (objective) attest characteristics that can be classified as trafficking in persons. Recruitment of persons (action) by deception (means) for their involvement in prostitution (objective) must also be viewed as trafficking.

Therefore, trafficking cases must entail one element of each of these three categories (action, means, objective). However, there are some exceptions concerning children. Article 3 (c) of the Protocol reads as follows: “the recruitment, transportation, transfer, harbor[u]ring or receipt of a child for the purpose of exploitation shall be considered as ‘trafficking in persons’ even if it does not involve any of the means set forth in subparagraph (a) of this article”.
In accordance with Articles 3 and 5 of the Protocol, state parties assume responsibility to adopt necessary legislative measures to criminalize deliberate actions committed internationally and involve sanctions. Such actions include the recruitment, transportation, transfer, harbouring or receipt of persons, by means of the threat or use of force or other forms of coercion, of abduction, of fraud, of deception, of the abuse of power or of a position of vulnerability or of the giving or receiving of payments or benefits to achieve the consent of a person having control over another person for the purpose of exploitation. Attempts to commit such crimes, be complicit in them, or organize or direct others to commit such crimes fall under the same category.

C. The Council of Europe Convention on Action against Trafficking in Human Beings

Council of Europe Convention on *Action against Trafficking in Human Beings* was signed by the Republic of Armenia on 16 May 2005 and ratified on 14 April 2008.

The purposes of this Convention are to prevent and combat trafficking in human beings, regardless of its form and nature, to protect the human rights of the victims of trafficking, to ensure effective investigation and prosecution, and to promote international cooperation on action against trafficking in human beings. Article 1 of this Convention specifies its purposes:

1. “to prevent and combat trafficking in human beings, while guaranteeing gender equality;

2. to protect the human rights of the victims of trafficking, [and] design a comprehensive framework for the protection and assistance of victims and witnesses, while guaranteeing gender equality, as well as ensure effective investigation and prosecution;

3. to promote international cooperation on action against trafficking in human beings.”
According to this Convention, the Republic of Armenia is to undertake a number of obligations, particularly to:

(a) Establish or strengthen national co-ordination between the various bodies responsible for preventing and combating trafficking in human beings as well as use effective means to elaborate policies and projects based on the priority of human rights, including a child-rights approach and gender equality.

(b) Adopt or strengthen legislative, administrative, educational, social, cultural or other measures to discourage the demand that fosters all forms of exploitation of persons, especially women and children.

(c) Without prejudice to international commitments in relation to the free movement of persons, strengthen, to the extent possible, border controls as may be necessary to prevent and detect trafficking in human beings,

(d) Provide competent authorities with persons who are trained and qualified in preventing and combating trafficking in human beings, in identifying victims of trafficking, and ensure that the different authorities collaborate with other state parties as well as with relevant support organizations, so that victims can be issued residence permits,

(e) Protect the private life and identity of victims. Personal data regarding them should be stored and used in accordance with the conditions provided for by the Convention for the Protection of Individuals with regard to Automatic Processing of Personal Data.

The Convention highlights issues, including other necessary legislative or other measures, to assist victims in their physical, psychological and social recovery, to issue a residence permit, legal assistance, and the right to free legal aid for victims, as well as provide victims with the right to compensation.

The Republic of Armenia is also under obligation to refrain from returning child victims to a particular state if a risk and security assessment determines that such a return would not be in the best interests of the child, and to apply the aforementioned measures
to promote gender equality and develop gender policy.

Special attention is paid to the criminalization of trafficking and a number of related issues, such as the imposition of penalties, the consideration of aggravating circumstances, among others.

The Convention also provides that a specific monitoring mechanism be established to monitor states’ compliance with the provisions of the Convention.

D. Human trafficking as considered under international law

International human rights law is instrumental in understanding the essence of human trafficking, but also defines the obligations that states must undertake in this area. A comprehensive set of international legal norms applies to various types of human trafficking for the purposes of sexual exploitation of women and children.

The first definition of slavery is provided in the Slavery Convention signed by the League of Nations in 1926: “Slavery is the status or condition of a person over whom any or all of the powers attaching to the right of ownership are exercised”.

In 1956 in Geneva, the United Nations adopted the Supplementary Convention on the Abolition of Slavery, the Slave Trade, and Institutions and Practices Similar to Slavery. Article 1 not only defined the concept of servitude, but also that of institutions and practices equivalent to slavery, as well as bondage. In particular, such institutions and practices include:

1. **Debt bondage**: the status or condition arising from a pledge by a debtor of his personal services or of those of a person under his control as security for a debt, if the value of those services as reasonably assessed is not applied towards the liquidation of the debt or the length and nature of those services are not respectively limited and defined;
2. **Serfdom**: the condition or status of a tenant who is by law, custom or agreement bound to live and labour on land belonging to another person and to render some determinate service to such other person, whether for reward or not, and is not free to change his status;

3. **Any institution or practice whereby**:
   
a) A woman, without the right to refuse, is promised or given in marriage on payment of money or in kind to her parents, guardian, family or any other person or group;

   b) The husband of a woman, his family, or his clan, has the right to transfer her to another person for value received or otherwise;

   c) A woman on the death of her husband is liable to be inherited by another person.

4. **Any institution or practice** whereby a child or young person under the age of 18 years is delivered by either or both of his natural parents or by his guardian to another person, whether for reward or not, with a view to the exploitation of the child or young person or of his/her labour.

   Article 2 (1) of Convention concerning Forced or Compulsory Labour adopted by the International Labour Organization in 1930 defines the concept of forced (or compulsory) labour or services. In particular, “forced or compulsory labour” means all work or services exacted from any person under the menace of any penalty and for which the said person has not offered him/her voluntarily. Nevertheless, Article 2 (2) reads that for the purposes of this Convention the term “forced or compulsory labor” shall not include:

   1. Any work or service exacted in virtue of compulsory military service laws for work of a purely military character;

   2. Any work or service which forms part of the normal civic obligations of the citizens of a fully self-governing country;
3. Any work or service exacted from any person as a consequence of a conviction in a court of law, provided that the said work or service is carried out under the supervision and control of a public authority and that the said person is not hired or placed at the disposal of private individuals, companies or associations;

4. Any work or service exacted in cases of emergency, that is to say, in the event of war or of a calamity or threatened calamity, such as fire, flood, famine, earthquake, violent epidemic or epizootic diseases, invasion by animal, insect or vegetable pests, and in general any circumstance that would endanger the existence or the well-being of the whole or part of the population;

5. Minor communal services of a kind which, being performed by the members of the community in the direct interest of the said community, can therefore be considered as normal civic obligations incumbent upon the members of the community, provided that the members of the community or their direct representatives shall have the right to be consulted in regard to the need for such services.

Slave toil and coercion is also prohibited by Article 4 of the Universal Declaration of Human Rights and Article 8 of the International Covenant of Civil and Political Rights which read: “No one shall be held in slavery or servitude; slavery and the slave trade shall be prohibited in all their forms”.

Article 32 of United Nations Convention on the Rights of the Child adopted in 1989 reads as follows: “States Parties recognize the right of the child to be protected from economic exploitation and from performing any work that is likely to be hazardous or to interfere with the child’s education, or to be harmful to the child’s health or physical, mental, spiritual, moral or social development”. According to Articles 34 and 35 of the same Convention:
“Article 34.

States Parties undertake to protect the child from all forms of sexual exploitation and sexual abuse. For these purposes, States Parties shall in particular take all appropriate national, bilateral and multilateral measures to prevent:

(a) The inducement or coercion of a child to engage in any unlawful sexual activity;

(b) The exploitative use of children in prostitution or other unlawful sexual practices;

(c) The exploitative use of children in pornographic performances and materials.

Article 35.

States Parties shall take all appropriate national, bilateral and multilateral measures to prevent the abduction of, the sale of or traffic in children for any purpose or in any form.

The United Nations Convention on the Elimination of All Forms of Discrimination against Women (Article 6), adopted in 1979, stipulates that states parties shall take all appropriate measures, including legislation, to suppress all forms of trafficking of women and the exploitation of the prostitution of women.

Article 1 of the United Nations International Convention on the Elimination of All Forms of Racial Discrimination, adopted in 1965, provides the following definition of racial discrimination:

“[T]he term ‘racial discrimination’ shall mean any distinction, exclusion, restriction or preference based on race, color, descent, or national or ethnic origin which has the purpose or effect of nullifying or impairing the recognition, enjoyment or exercise, on an equal footing, of human rights and fundamental freedoms in the political, economic, social, cultural or any other field of public life.”
E. Elements of crime of trafficking in persons stipulated in the Criminal Code of the Republic of Armenia\textsuperscript{10}

The Criminal Code of the Republic of Armenia deems as criminal offence both the recruitment, transportation, transfer, harbouring or receipt of persons for the purpose of exploitation and implication of persons into prostitution or other forms of sexual exploitation, forced labour, services, slavery or practices similar to slavery or retention in this state. The two aforementioned elements of crime are directly linked to trafficking in persons; these are grave offences committed against the freedom of a human being.

In 2011, the Criminal Code of the Republic of Armenia introduced an article imposing criminal liability for using services of trafficked persons:

\textit{Criminal Code of the Republic of Armenia}

\textbf{Article 132. Human trafficking}\textsuperscript{11}

1. Human trafficking, i.e. recruitment, transportation, transfer, harbouring or receipt of persons for the purpose of exploitation, as well as exploiting persons or placing or retaining them in the state of exploitation, by threat or use of violence not dangerous for life or health, or other forms of coercion by means of abduction, fraud, abuse of a position of vulnerability or of giving, receiving or promising payments or benefits to achieve the consent of a person having control over another person is punishable with imprisonment for the term of 5 to 8 years with or without confiscation of property, forfeiture of the right to hold certain posts or practice certain activities for a maximum of 3 years or without that.

2. The same action committed:
   1) against two or more persons;

\textsuperscript{10} Quotations from laws are written in italic, for sources see the relevant laws of the Code.
\textsuperscript{11} Quotations from laws are written in italic, for sources see the relevant laws of the Code.
2) by a group of persons with premeditated conspiracy;
3) with abuse of official power;
4) by threat or use of violence dangerous for life or health;
5) against a woman with prior knowledge of her pregnancy;
6) by crossing the state border of the Republic of Armenia
to smuggle a person;

is punishable with imprisonment for the term of 7 to 12 years with
or without confiscation of property, forfeiture of the right to hold
certain posts or practice certain activities for a maximum of 3 years
or without that.

3. The action covered in Sections 1 or 2 of this Article, which
1) is committed by an organized group;
2) is caused by negligence the death of the victim or other
grave consequences;

is punishable with imprisonment for the term of 10 to 14 years
with or without confiscation of property, forfeiture of the right to
hold certain posts or practice certain activities for a maximum of 3
years or without that.

4. For the purposes of this Article and Article 132(2) of this
Code, exploitation shall mean the implication of others into
prostitution or other forms of sexual exploitation, forced
labour or services, enslavement or practices similar to slavery
or the removal of organs or tissues.

5. Persons affected by a crime under this Article and Article
132.2 of this Code shall be relieved of criminal responsibility
for minor and medium severity crimes if they were forced
to commit them in the situation resulting from their status.
Article 132\textsuperscript{2}. Trafficking or exploitation of a child or a person who is unable to realize or control the nature and significance of his/her actions due to a mental disorder\textsuperscript{12}

1. Recruitment, transportation, transfer, harbouring or receipt of a child or a person unable to fully or partially realize or control the nature or significance of his/her actions due to a mental disorder, for the purpose of exploitation, as well as exploiting such persons or placing or retaining them in the state of exploitation, is punishable with imprisonment for the term of 7 to 10 years with or without confiscation of property, forfeiture of the right to hold certain posts or practice certain activities for a maximum of 3 years or without that.

2. The same action committed:
   1) against two or more persons;
   2) by a group of persons with premeditated conspiracy;
   3) with abuse of official power;
   4) by threat or use of violence dangerous for life or health;
   5) by means of abduction;
   6) against a woman with prior knowledge of her pregnancy;
   7) by crossing the state border of the Republic of Armenia to smuggle a person;

is punishable with imprisonment for the term of 10 to 12 years with or without confiscation of property, forfeiture of the right to hold certain posts or practice certain activities for a maximum of 3 years or without that.

3. The action covered in Sections 1 or 2 of this Article, which
   1) is committed by an organized group;
   2) caused by negligence the death of the victim or other grave consequences

is punishable with imprisonment for the term of 12 to 15 years with or without confiscation of property, forfeiture of the right to hold certain posts or practice certain activities for a maximum of 3 years or without that.

Article 132³. Using services of trafficked persons¹³

1. Using the services of a trafficked person, should any such status become obvious to the user, and provided that his/her actions do not contain any incriminating elements specified under Article 132 or Article 132.2 hereof is punishable with a fine of 100-400 times the amount of minimal salary or with a maximum imprisonment of two years.

2. The same action committed:
   1) against a person with prior knowledge of his/her minor age;
   2) against a person unable to fully or partially realize or control the nature or significance of his/her actions due to a mental disorder;
   3) against a woman with prior knowledge of her pregnancy;
   4) against two or more persons is punishable with imprisonment for a maximum of 3 years with or without forfeiture of the right to hold certain posts or practice certain activities for a maximum of 3 years or without that.

3. Any person who acts of his/her own accord and provides information to law-enforcement authorities of the Republic of Armenia is exempted from the criminal liability set forth herein, if his/her action contains no other incriminating elements.

Recruitment of persons for the purpose of exploitation is the implication of victims by various means (using violence, threats, deception and other means) in a group of persons intended to become an object of human trafficking. Such recruitment may include, for instance, drafting a list of persons leaving abroad allegedly to seek employment, signing fake labour contracts, etc. Transportation of victims for exploitative purposes consists in their transference from place to place. This may mean, for instance, transport of victims by air or bus from the country of origin to the country of destination.

Transfer means leaving the victim under the control of receiving persons. This includes, for instance, cases when victims are transferred to the representatives of the criminal group for the purposes of sexual exploitation or removal of internal organs. Once the victim is at the disposal of the receiving person the transfer is deemed to be complete.

Harbouring means isolation of victims and keeping their location a secret. This includes harbouring victims of trafficking, for example, in a cellar or a garage for their further transfer to criminals.

Receipt of persons means that traffickers receive victims from others and keep them under their control. This includes, for instance, cases when criminals receive victims for the purpose of implicating them in “forced labor” (Ghazinyan, 2007:202-3).

People are trafficked using violence or threats or by using other forms of coercion such as abduction, deception, abuse of vulnerability, or by using payment and transfer of values to persons retaining control over victims in order to achieve the consent of the former.

Violence means the use of physical force, the infliction of blows and bodily injuries, hair pulling, binding and other actions intended to suppress the resistance of the victim. Moreover, both victims and their close relatives may suffer from violence.

Threat of violence means that in order to recruit, transport, transfer and harbour persons for the purpose of their exploitation, offenders suppress victims’ resistance by threatening to use physical violence. Victims find themselves in imminent risk of such threats being carried out with no other options.

Other forms of coercion imply using violence or threats to suppress victims’ resistance. Such forms of coercion include the threat of disclosing unpleasant information to victims’ family members, destruction or damage to their property, etc.

Abduction means taking away persons against or without their will from their natural social environment and their place of permanent or temporary residence for the purpose of transferring them to or keeping them in some other place.
Deception in this context means a premeditated misrepresentation or concealment of facts, and misinformation on certain facts, circumstances and events in order to recruit, transport, transfer, harbour or receive persons for their further exploitation. For example, this refers to cases when criminals accompany their victims to the place of destination, where they will be subjected to sexual exploitation or forced labour by means of concealing or distorting the true purpose of their travel, and, upon arrival, refuse to return the victims’ identification papers and force them to engage in prostitution.

Deception, frequently used by human traffickers who promise their victims a lucrative job and then exploit them, is planned well before arrival.\textsuperscript{14}

Abuse of victims’ vulnerability refers to taking advantage of a situation which will leave the victim without acceptable alternatives to being exploited. Vulnerability can take various forms: physical, psychological, emotional, domestic, social or economic. Examples include insecure or unlawful legal status, economic dependence or poor health. In other words, such situations can be brought about by any predicament and make people give in to their exploiters. In such cases, criminals abusing the vulnerability of their victims flagrantly violate human rights as well as the principles of personal dignity and integrity.

Another method used in trafficking is giving payments or benefits to achieve the consent of a person exercising control over the victim. The person with control over victims is the person who, by virtue of certain relations, can control them. Such persons can be the victim’s parents (foster parents), guardians, trustees, kindergarten teachers, school teachers, coaches, and others.

In fact, these bribes motivate these persons to give their consent for the exploitation of the person/people under their control. Such bribes and payments may be in the form of monetary sums, valuables or other expensive items. It should be mentioned that in this case, both the individuals giving these payments and those receiving them (persons having control over the victim) are criminally liable for their acts.

\textsuperscript{14} Article 132\textsuperscript{2} amended under Law N 69-N of 1 March 2011.
Human trafficking is aimed at the exploitation of persons. Article 132 (4) of the Criminal Code of the Republic of Armenia states that exploitation means forcing people into prostitution or other forms of sexual exploitation, forced labour or the removal of body parts and internal organs. It is noteworthy, however, that human trafficking is not always defined by means of exploitation. *Persons are considered to be trafficked if they are exposed to any actions and means specified in this Article. Therefore, it can be concluded that trafficking occurs before the actual exploitation of the victims.*

**Prostitution** means having random, extramarital sexual contacts not based on personal affection and sexual attraction towards the partner. Forcing people into prostitution means that third parties forcing prostitutes into sexual relations profit financially. What is more, they can also gain non-material profits, for example as they “present prostitutes to others as gifts” without payment. Exploitation of prostitutes includes not only situations where traffickers take away all the money prostitutes earn for providing sexual services or where prostitutes receive no payment at all, but also situations where sex workers obtain only a tiny portion of their earnings.

**Other forms of sexual exploitation** include those in which victims are forced to work in other branches of the sex industry, for example, strip-tease, posing for erotic magazines or acting in pornographic films. Moreover, sexual exploitation may often be accompanied by rape or sexual violence.

**Trafficking in persons for the purpose of organ and tissue removal** is another very dangerous type of trafficking, which is currently very common in developing countries.

**Abuse of power** means abuse of authority by an official. In order to force people into prostitution or other forms of sexual exploitation, forced labour or similar services, or to remove human organs, criminals abuse their power or fail to perform their professional duties for their own mercenary reasons, other motives or group interests. For instance, high-ranking police officials may abuse their authority to arrange unhindered transfers of victims to the places of destination.
Forcing people into prostitution or other forms of sexual exploitation, forced labour, provision of compulsory services, slavery or near-slavery, or retaining them in this state means constant coercion, inducement or inclination of the victim to engage in such activities. Criminals use violence or threats as well as other forms of coercion through abduction, deception, abuse of vulnerability, and payments to persons retaining control over victims in order to obtain the consent of the former.

Besides, it should be mentioned that human trafficking is not always defined through exploitation alone. Persons are considered to be trafficked if they are exposed to any actions and means specified in the definition outlined above.

F. Anti-trafficking action in the Republic of Armenia

In the Republic of Armenia, fight against trafficking dates back to October, 2002 as the first Inter-Agency Committee on Action against Trafficking in Human Beings (THB) was set up under the lead of the Ministry of Foreign Affairs, with the aim of examining issues related to illegal transportation, transfer and trafficking in human beings from Armenia. In 2007, the Council to Combat Trafficking in Human Beings (hereafter “Anti-Trafficking Council”) was set up by Decree No. 861-A of the Government of Armenia. The Council is chaired by the Deputy Prime Minister of Armenia and is composed of the representatives of all stakeholder ministries and agencies, experts from the National Assembly and the Government as well as representatives of non-governmental organizations.

In order to organize the activities of the Anti-Trafficking Council and facilitate its work, the Armenian Government has set up an Inter-institutional Working Group. This Working Group is subordinated to the Anti-Trafficking Council and is chaired by the Director of the Department of International Organizations of the Ministry of Foreign Affairs. The non-governmental and international organizations working in the field of counter-trafficking, as well as social partners actively participate in and contribute to the activities of the Council and the Working Group.

The National Referral Mechanism for Trafficked Persons (NRM) was approved by Decree No. 1385-A of 28 November 2008 of the Government of Armenia. The Regulation for the functioning of the NRM, included in an appendix of this Decree, prescribes the roles of relevant State bodies and local authorities in identifying and assisting victims of trafficking, the principles of co-operation among them, victim identification and types of assistance to victims.

The framework of the third National Program

The third 2010-2012 National Anti-Trafficking Response in the Republic of Armenia has defined multiple goals addressed to different aspects of combating human trafficking. The strategies and actions presented in the Program are targeted at the organizing of an efficient anti-trafficking response and fall under the following 6 main categories: improvement of anti-trafficking legislation and law enforcement; prevention of trafficking in human beings; protection and support of victims of trafficking; cooperation; carrying out studies; and monitoring and evaluation.

The program paid greater attention to the prevention of human trafficking. Special attention was devoted to the trainings and education for the relevant authorities responsible for fight against trafficking. Special trainings were organized on identification, referral and assistance of victims of trafficking and on crime prevention and detection.
Educational modules on human trafficking for law enforcement bodies and civil servants were developed and introduced. Special attention was devoted to the problem of child trafficking and to its prevention and awareness-raising activities have been implemented for the staff and children of special child care institutions. Educational manuals on human trafficking for secondary and high school teachers and students were developed and incorporated in the school program. Extensive campaigns and programs have been carried out among youth.

The semiannual and annual reports of the Anti-Trafficking Council on the implementation of the 2010-2012 National Action Plan were presented to the Government of Armenia.

Within the framework of the third National Program, an independent monitoring of the Program implementation has been conducted and the results and recommendation of the monitoring have been considered during the development of the forth National Program.

The framework of the forth National Program

The forth 2013-2015 National Action Plan includes the main directions of the previous program but is more victim oriented. The forth Program aims at mobilizing the State efforts in improvement of relevant procedures for identification of victims of trafficking by adopting necessary sub-legislative acts and for provision of support to the victims by building capacities of relevant authorities and by creating financial ground.

The one of main goals of the Fourth Program is conducting surveys, including the working children.

In the Forth Program great attention was devoted to the prevention of human trafficking, especially to prevention of labor exploitation among the population and the vulnerable groups.

One of the main directions of the Program is development of cooperation with the mass media in highlighting the phenomenon of human trafficking, and in data protection.

For evaluation of the effectiveness of the Program it is envisaged to conduct mid-term and final independent monitoring.
The Program was developed by the Working Group of the Anti-
trafficking Council of the Republic of Armenia. The monitoring
results of the Third Program, as well as the recommendations of
the 2012 Report concerning the implementation of the Council
of Europe Convention on Action against Trafficking in Human
Beings by Armenia and the US Department of State Report were
considered in the Fourth Program.

The strategies and actions presented in the Program are targeted
at the organizing of an efficient anti-trafficking response and fall
under the following 5 main categories:

1) anti-trafficking legislation and law enforcement;
2) prevention of trafficking in human beings;
3) protection and support of victims of trafficking;
4) cooperation;
5) carrying out studies, monitoring and evaluation.

RESEARCH PAPER TOPICS

1. Human trafficking as a form of transnational organized
crime
2. International documents on human trafficking and
Armenian legislation. Comparative review
3. Trafficking situation in various countries. Comparative
analysis
4. Internet coverage of human trafficking
5. Coverage of human trafficking in mainstream media
6. Human trafficking in fiction or cinema

DISCUSSION TOPICS

1. Human trafficking has become a matter of serious concern
for modern society
2. Human trafficking will persist as long as humanity exists.
3. Combating human trafficking is a problem for all society.
TOPIC 2. CAUSES AND FACTORS LEADING TO HUMAN TRAFFICKING

Knowledge of causes and factors leading to human trafficking is essential for preventing and forestalling its incidence. Revealing such causes explains why human trafficking is still very common and exists despite the concerted efforts of the international community.\textsuperscript{15} Examination of factors leading to trafficking draws a clear picture of how recruiters think and what manipulation techniques they employ and provides protection against such crimes by avoiding unwise conduct and specifically victim behavior. Some causes of human trafficking are discussed below.

A. Economic globalization

The growth of the global economy and the globalization of trade are natural social developments which have both positive and negative implications. A negative effect is that global trade provides fertile ground for trafficking in persons. The market becomes more flexible and changeable due to the expansion of economic relations. Private businessmen and enterprises no longer have to manufacture and sell their products in their home country: now they have ample opportunities of doing so anywhere on the globe at maximum profit. International trafficking in persons is also guided by market principles.

Production is transferred to locations which provide the minimal relevant expense. A great number of well-known enterprises either intend to transfer or have already transferred their production to “Third World” countries. In this case, the main economic resource is labour, i.e. workers ready to accept less favorable terms of employment, lower salaries and absence of social guarantees. While these practices by no means amount to human trafficking \textit{per se}, they allow some criminal “dealers” in some countries to “create new jobs” for illegal migrants or unskilled workers and subject them to ruthless exploitation.

Some businesses choose to use cheap labour available in their own country rather than transfer their production abroad. For instance,

\textsuperscript{15} Ibid, p.204.
the flood of migrant workers into Russia has created a temptation which is hard to resist for some “businessmen”. Furthermore, incoming cheap labour sparks intense market competition, which can lead to slashing labour costs and aggravating the human trafficking situation.

Development of and access to means of communication allows people to travel freely around the globe. In its turn, this positive development trend enables criminals to run a black market of sex and organ transplant services alongside booming global, legal tourism. In some countries, criminals stir the demand for virgins to benefit from it.

**B. Economic and legal differences of states and regions**

There are economic and legal differences in various states and regions, some of which have been outlined above. Media coverage of the economic and legal benefits of living in developed countries turns these countries into an irresistible temptation for those living in poor countries. It is noteworthy that the economic situations in developing countries often deteriorate as a result of a series of coups d’état, civil wars or wars across national borders. Poverty and famine are further aggravated by fears for the future of children. Absence of prospects, harsh living conditions and poverty raise the likelihood of being sucked into trafficking. With no alternative to provide subsistence for their families, people try to gain entry to countries with better living conditions at any cost. Most of them attempt illegal migration, which in itself does not amount to trafficking. However, illegal migrants are more prone to the risks of human trafficking as they are unable to seek assistance from state authorities of the destination country when they fall victim to slavery or find themselves in situations in which their rights are violated.

In a market economy, it is very important for employers to reduce the costs of labour. Large industrial companies in Europe and in North America often transfer their operations to “Third World” countries, where wages are considerably lower than in their home countries. While small and big businesses cannot always afford to transfer their operation to other countries, they can instead seek
out low-cost labour. Refugees and illegal migrants who, unlike the natives, agree to work for low wages are considered cheap labour. Sometimes people are forced to work without any payment at all through deception or intimidation. Many self-styled companies are run in conflict with the law and labour legislation. They illegally ignore workers’ right to labour insurance and annual leave, and avoid paying all the taxes they owe. No citizens of developed countries would agree to work on such terms; therefore, employers resort to employing refugees and illegal migrants from poor countries. The need to cut production costs has led to an increased demand for migrant labour and female household servants from abroad. As the elderly population of eastern Europe grows, so does the demand for domestic servants to look after the elderly. Thus, women are frequently recruited for domestic services while men are mostly assigned to work on construction sites.

Some countries have a child labour market. Child labour is even cheaper as children are much more vulnerable to exploitation than adults. Child labour is mostly exploited in the cotton industry and housekeeping. Children are also forced into begging and becoming criminal accomplices.

The fact that women find themselves in far worse economic conditions than men also contributes to the growth of trafficking. The so-called feminization of poverty stems from gender inequality, namely the clear division of male and female labour and remuneration. For poverty-related reasons, women enjoy reduced opportunities to make a free choice and therefore, find themselves more vulnerable to human trafficking.

Dominant traditional (patriarchal) approaches to gender roles reserve housekeeping duties for women, along with the care of children and elderly persons in the family. Hence, the leading role of men in decision-making, coupled with gender inequality in labour market, underlies poverty among women, which immediately affects children (their direct dependents). The “feminization” of poverty is frequently accompanied by the worsening of living conditions for children, who can also end up as targets of traffickers.
C. Human organ and tissue transplantation as a result of scientific progress in medicine

Despite good intentions to prolong life and restore health, organ and tissue transplants are create a conducive atmosphere for human trafficking, but how? Obviously, those who can pay for human organs and tissues outnumber donors. This creates excessive demand which spurs higher prices, and promotes criminal activity to gain access to easy and quick income.

According to data published in 2003, about 40,000 patients from Eastern Europe are on waiting lists for a kidney transplant. On average, the waiting period is three years. Due to long waiting lists, 15-30% of patients have very slim survival chances. The waiting period in 2010 could well last up to ten years, as the demand for human organs continues to grow day by day. Well-off buyers from developed countries place a high value on their health and are more interested in buying human organs. Many countries, including Armenia, have rules stipulating that living donors can donate their organs only to their own family members or close relatives. It is forbidden to receive or request payment for organs, as trade in human organs is illegal.

In some cases human organs are objects for magic rituals, sorcery, cannibalism and other practices. International criminal communities are well aware of the great demand for human organs and the limited supply; therefore, they take advantage of the situation to put pressure on disadvantaged people and force them to sell their own organs. Traffickers frequently achieve their desired results through the use of violence.

D. The concept of victim behaviour

The word victim comes from Latin. Victim behaviour comprises behaviour patterns which make it easier for a person to fall victim to a crime or face danger which usually could be avoided. Victim behaviour is the aggregate of physical, psychological and social qualities gained by a person who, as a result, may fall victim to a crime or a certain situation.
Victim behaviour implies behavioural patterns through which people expose themselves to danger (frequently unconsciously). For instance, a pedestrian crossing the street at a red light or in a forbidden place is an example of victim behaviour and increases the risk of being run over by a car.

Individual victim behaviour means that individuals are able to create or greatly contribute to conditions favourable for crimes. For instance, a (physically frail) person is taking an evening walk and, by showing characteristics of victim behavior, not only fails to keep away from an intoxicated person (who can hardly walk and is mumbling swear words) but rather decides to “preach” to him/her, explaining that good manners forbid saying swear words in public. It is quite possible the drunk person would be annoyed with this kind of “preaching” and he/she might even react violently towards the “preacher”.

The following types of victim behaviour can be outlined:

a) Typical victim behaviour as a relative “tendency” of people to be exposed to any crime, such as rape, fraud, robbery, etc;

b) Group victim behaviour as a threat for certainsocial groups to incur physical, psychological and material harm conditioned by the peculiarities of the group and also by crimes committed against the group.

Victim behaviour can also be assessed using other standards (e.g. profession), for example the victim behaviour of cashiers, money collectors, and police officers. This type of victim behaviour is called “group victim behaviour”. Victim behaviour itself does not mean that a victim’s conduct is immoral or illegal; however, it can be described as a personal quality which makes it easy for a person to fall victim to a potential crime. For example, people can fall victim to a crime due to over self-confidence, age (minors), or occupation (police officers, security guards, etc.); however, this is not enough to make judgements about their inadequate behavior or negative personal qualities.

By nature, people can show not only criminal, but also victim behavior, for example, risky, careless, indiscreet, hasty, provocative or dangerous behaviour patterns.
According to the circumstances, the following two kinds of victim behaviour can be distinguished:

1. *Inevitable victim behaviour*: It is easier to rob a person who is suffering a heart attack; if a person is in difficulty, he/she will be more likely to accept a tempting offer and fall victim to trafficking;

2. *Evitable victim behaviour*: It is easier to rob a person who is intoxicated or very drunk; it is easier to exploit a person who has taken offence to something his/her family members have said/done and is thus trying to punish them and “make them understand” something.

Many crimes, including exploitation, are usually caused by victim behaviour, i.e. inadequate actions under certain physical and psychological conditions, careless and indiscreet behaviour with others (which affects people’s self-esteem or personal property), unwillingness to cooperate with law-enforcement authorities, illegal deals, and rash actions. Without any doubt, perpetrators of a crime are those who must be held liable; however, avoiding victim behaviour may offer better odds against the risks of trafficking. Many crimes could be avoided if victims showed prudence and were ready to prevent commitment of dangerous acts or crimes. When recruited, potential victims exhibit the following forms of victim behaviour:

- Trusting friends and casual acquaintances without sufficient grounds;
- Lack of a critical approach in trusting announcements of work abroad without checking their reliability;
- Placing implicit trust in marriage announcements;
- Placing implicit trust in online announcements.

*Remember that reasonable doubt and critical thinking will help you avoid victim behaviour and deception.*

Keep in mind that recruiters are quite good at influencing people and manipulating their dreams and ambitions. When promised the earth or easy income overnight, prudence and caution is advised.
Today, we live in an age of increasingly intensive and mobile global interactions. Critical thinking and awareness of potential risks is required when considering any proposal.16

RESEARCH PAPER TOPICS

1. Illegal migration and human trafficking
2. Economic inequality as a factor for human trafficking
3. Gender inequality as a factor for human trafficking
4. Economic and psychological factors of human trafficking
5. Victim behaviour as a trafficking factor
6. Situation of human trafficking in Armenia
7. The role of public awareness in countering human trafficking

DISCUSSION TOPICS

1. A world without trafficking: is it possible?
2. Potential victims of human trafficking are either rural inhabitants or migrants
3. Victims of trafficking are themselves to blame for what happened because of being too naive
4. Both men and women are equally vulnerable to trafficking
5. Both children and adults are equally vulnerable to trafficking
6. Are job offers from people you know trustworthy?
7. People with higher education do not become victims of trafficking
8. Mass media unwittingly encourage aggravation of the trafficking situation
9. You can meet “wise guys” everywhere; therefore, can you be deceived even in your home country?

---

16 Human trafficking is quoted as the third most profitable business of organized crime after drugs and the arms trade. For more information, please see http://www.houstonrr.org
CHAPTER 2. ANTI-TRAFFICKING ACTIONS

The new century and millennium have not only introduced an epoch but also represent a new milestone in human civilization marked by globalization, the increased role of information, and communication technologies. Globalization drives modern societies to share not only the achievements of progress but also the problems it entails, such as human trafficking, violence, drug abuse among children and young people, natural and man-made disasters, information wars, uncontrollable information flows, etc.

Today, human trafficking is a problem of alarming proportions and is a matter of serious concern for all civilized humanity. Available data suggest that every year one million people worldwide fall victim to exploitation in their countries of origin, while another million people are moved to other countries; the annual profit gained from human trafficking by criminal networks and individuals amounts to approximately USD 7.5 billion.

Many nations are trying to collaboratively abolish this “present-day slavery”. Measures taken include social control over human trafficking and its international recognition. Trafficking in persons is recognized in national and international legislation, agreements, protocols and many other instruments. Therefore, there is a high priority to counter human trafficking.

Despite the current lack of accurate data, it can be argued that Armenia is predominantly a country of origin, that is to say, a “supplier” of potential trafficking victims. There are currently many known cases of labour and sexual exploitation of Armenian women, men, minors and young people in other countries.
TOPIC 1. PREVENTION OF HUMAN TRAFFICKING

A. The concept of prevention of human trafficking

The professional literature (on criminology) defines the concept of crime prevention as a set of measures and agents that entails:

- Identifying, eliminating and counteracting the root causes and triggers of crime and its certain types;
- Establishing and eliminating underlying motives of crime in a certain area;
- Identifying high-risk population groups exposed to crime;
- Identifying persons who potentially demonstrate typical criminal conduct and taking preventive and disciplinary actions (such actions may also involve family members, relatives or friends, as necessary) (Kurdiavtseva, 2002:279-80).

Prevention of human trafficking has three aspects, which containing the following components:

1. Prevention of events before their occurrence

Combating supply and demand for women and men on the sexual and labour service market requires providing buyers and victims of these services with relevant information and adopting economic policies to create more employment opportunities for men, women and young girls.

2. Efforts to reduce the incidence of human trafficking

- Implementing assistance programmes for high-risk groups comprising, for example, young men in rural areas, persons leaving their home country, or women without education;
- Visiting families exposed to high levels of risk;
- Stimulating the activities of law-enforcement authorities in their fight against traffickers;
• Establishing state control over the activities of travel agencies, employment agencies, dating agencies, airline companies and consular services, which play a role in this scheme;
• Imposing more severe sanctions on criminals.

3. Reducing the incidence and harmful consequences of human trafficking:
Stimulating the activities of law-enforcement authorities, providing rehabilitation of victims, and preventing situations that may entail re-victimization.17

B. Preventive measures against trafficking in persons
It follows that the prevention of human trafficking calls for both public action (economic, social, ideological, legal and educational) and specific measures by law-enforcement authorities.

A. M. Bandurka specifies the following activities to prevent trafficking:
• Legal, awareness-raising and advocacy campaigns;
• Timely identification and neutralization of human trafficking and its contributing factors;
• Promotion of investigations to identify perpetrators and victims of trafficking; correction of any shortcomings in anti-trafficking initiatives;
• Involvement of society and the police in anti-trafficking actions18

Below some essential anti-trafficking actions and strategies are discussed.

1. Forewarned is forearmed
This motto perfectly captures the essence of the prevention of trafficking and addresses the need for raised awareness of trafficking risks among various social groups. In fact, the motto suggests:

17 The next section suggests a number of guidelines to prevent human trafficking.
• Public awareness raising, especially among vulnerable risk groups and potential victims of trafficking;
• Raising awareness with regard to travel, dating or employment agencies (offering services abroad);
• Raising the awareness of law-enforcement authorities and other state agencies directly dealing with various population groups;
• Raising awareness of human trafficking issues in mass media, etc.

In particular, persons vulnerable to trafficking need to have access to information on:

• Recruitment techniques deployed by traffickers;
• Legal requirements for migration to other countries and legal employment opportunities;
• Various sexually transmitted diseases spread through sex services and exploitation;
• Data on organizations which can be contacted for detailed information.

Informational and educational campaigns to raise the awareness of various social groups must view trafficking as an urgent problem affecting modern society and cover issues related to civil society, human rights and gender equality. In this context, a crucial role is played by stereotypes and biases deeply rooted in the Armenian public mind.

Human trafficking is, then, highly influenced by widely-held opinions concerning the roles and duties reserved for men and women, their conduct and value sets, as well as the gender-based division of labour. Widowed, divorced or single women who have no bread-winner (i.e., man) in their family and lack opportunities and access to education, professional skills and employment have limited choices to maintain their family and, therefore, are more vulnerable to traffickers and sexual exploitation. In the same way, gender misconceptions reserve the role of breadwinner for men, who procure means of existence for their families. As a rule, high unemployment rates for the male population renders them vulnerable to false promises of jobs (mostly in construction) in line with their perceived status. Men and women implicated in sexual
services or forced labour and controlled by others feel shame and fear stigmatization for their conduct, which may be in conflict with accepted societal norms. Their behaviour is deemed unacceptable and contrary to the image of a “decent” woman and a “masculine” man respectively. Therefore, upon returning to their home country, men and women avoid sharing their experiences, seek anonymity and refuse to cooperate with investigators.

Stereotyping and discrimination are also expressed through the unsympathetic labelling of female victims of trafficking as “prostitutes” and misusing the word “pimp” instead of the term “trafficker”. This prejudice is supported by the popular opinion that female victims of trafficking are prostitutes to begin with, offer sexual services, or “expect what would happen to them” and, therefore, are considered to have acquiesced to exploitation.

Therefore, changing deeply-rooted stereotypes, ideas and approaches in Armenian society, creating an atmosphere of compassion and understanding, and realizing that trafficking poses a gender-based human rights problem all constitute one of the main elements of awareness-raising campaigns to prevent trafficking.

Sustained and hard efforts are required in order to shatter stereotypes and defy concepts and approaches rooted in the public mind. In particular, the following viewpoints should be encouraged among the population:

- Trafficking is not equated to prostitution.
- The consent of the victim is unwarranted if obtained by traffickers through means mentioned in the definition of “trafficking”.
- Forced prostitution is not the only form of human trafficking, which includes, inter alia, labour exploitation, forced begging, forced military service, removal and sale of human organs, debt bondage, and others.
- Men can also be victims of trafficking.

To raise the awareness of governmental and non-governmental organizations directly dealing with human trafficking, a series of appropriate actions should be taken, for instance, special training
and educational programmes, qualification-raising courses, the provision of informational materials on trafficking, social support for victims, the creation of employment opportunities and free medical services, round-table discussions and strategy sessions on various strategic issues, seminars, etc.

The International Organization for Migration (IOM) is in technical cooperation with governments and non-governmental organizations and is implementing various projects aimed at building the capacity of governments and civil society institutions to find better solutions to problems stemming from trafficking. This cooperation entails:

- training for NGO employees, civil servants, and law-enforcement officers;
- technical support in drafting legislation and developing policies and procedures, as well as improving state structures dealing with the problem of human trafficking.

2. Increased role of mass media.

Mass media play a critical role in countering human trafficking; however, all reporting on trafficking must be complete and accurate. First of all, strengthening the role of mass media includes the development of long-term working regulations in cooperation with both state and private television and radio companies in order to provide coverage on national anti-human-trafficking actions. This could be done through special broadcasts and communications, free screenings of thematic films and videos, and public service announcements. It is necessary to give regular media coverage to measures taken to combat trafficking and also to secure the involvement of competent professionals in radio and TV broadcasts, press conferences and the publication of articles. Special seminars and training should be organized in order to raise the awareness of journalists covering trafficking issues and to form an ethical and professional approach to information on trafficking.

Today's world is characterized by increased and unprecedented flows of information through the growth of communication...
technologies. These technologies have grown into a powerful and effective instrument to mobilize society, guide social movements, and contribute to development. Therefore, the use of information and communication technologies in anti-trafficking actions will prove highly effective.

The Internet is increasingly popular in Armenia, which suggests an opportunity for advanced preventive action against trafficking, namely coverage and anti-trafficking initiatives in social networks, active discussions, and regular website updates (http://www.antitraficking.am; http://www.iom.int/armenia).

3. Preventing exploitation of minors

It is envisaged that the State support to graduates of children’s trustee organizations project will be continued. This project provides graduates with accommodation and includes them on priority lists as beneficiaries of state employment programmes.

Prevention of trafficking will also be greatly facilitated by offering special training for social workers of orphanages and special schools, as well as officers of police divisions dealing with juvenile issues.

Preventing the exploitation of minors would be significantly supported by developing teaching materials (curricula, manuals, films, videos, public service announcements) and distributing them to students and adolescents, as well as by organizing workshops. These workshops would cover both information directly related to the risks of human trafficking and the ways to avoid it. They would also provide general information on factors which pose problems in terms of vulnerability, human rights, dignity and integrity, gender equality and tolerance. Additionally, vocational counselling and training for adolescents are imperative.

4. Social and economic programmes

Considering that poverty and unemployment are the key factors spurring human trafficking in Armenia, it is planned to emphasize
the social and economic aspects of national programmes and to integrate anti-trafficking measures into the strategic poverty reduction programme of the Republic of Armenia in order to protect the most vulnerable social groups. The intention also exists to integrate trafficking-related issues into projects aimed at contributing to gender equality, development, and the elimination of corruption.

In particular, special projects should be implemented to promote entrepreneurship activities of unemployed or refugee women, as well as the working activities of women living in rural areas. Such projects should be combined with awareness-raising publications and programmes.

Unemployed women and young people should be offered vocational counselling and training for trades which are in high demand in the labour market.

The anti-trafficking actions described above are based on a strategy built around the fact that human exploitation is driven by demand. Therefore, states and intergovernmental organizations must target factors which increase people’s vulnerability to human trafficking, such as gender inequality, poverty and all forms of discrimination.

C. Youth as a risk group for trafficking

Victims of human trafficking are mostly individuals or groups with relatively poor prospects, who constitute risk groups. Other contributing factors to human trafficking are poverty, gender inequality and youth.

Some factors which raise the risk of exploitation for young people include:

- Higher education is an indicator of individual’s status and requires substantial expense. On the one hand, higher education makes it easy to obtain employment related to one’s training or education; on the other, the number of state-subsidized university places is low. Students mostly find themselves in a financial situation that makes it
impossible for them to simultaneously live and pay tuition fees.

- *Unemployment among young people.* In Armenia, unemployment rates are high among young people aged between 18 and 25 years. These young people cannot find jobs despite great effort and diligence. It is possible to link this to the lack of previous work experience required by employers.

- *Drug addiction, alcoholism and gambling.* Young drug addicts, alcoholics and gamblers easily fall victim to human trafficking and are readily recruited as they are vulnerable to external influence.

- *Gender-based division of work and discrimination in the labour market.* Many employers prefer to employ men rather than women as they believe that pregnant women and women with children are no longer properly committed to their work.

- *Conflicts between standards applicable to young people and their real capacities.* Society has been transformed into a “consumer” society and mass media – through advertisements and films – often portray a lifestyle for young people which they cannot possibly afford.

- *Social marginalization of certain groups.* Both homeless and independent (i.e. those who have left orphanages) children are at risk as they lack essential social relations and support. It is arguably quite easy to gain the confidence of such children and to abuse this trust as they have neither permanent residence nor adult guarantors.

- *Additional difficulties faced by young people living in remote regions or villages.* Young people living in remote regions or villages mostly lack the necessary links to obtain well-paid employment.

- *Insufficient activity of educational institutions supported by mass media to prevent trafficking.*

- *Young people are often too optimistic and naive.* Sometimes they are overly self-confident (mostly due to their young
D. Cooperation in anti-trafficking actions

Considering the nature of human trafficking and its characteristics, it is clear that the effectiveness of ant-trafficking actions is dependent on successful cooperation, as indicated in the Council of Europe’s (CoE) Convention on Action against Trafficking in Human Beings (2005). According to the clauses of the convention, cooperation is viewed in two ways: \textit{international cooperation and cooperation with civil society}.

International cooperation means that CoE State Parties must cooperate with each other in accordance with the provisions of the Convention, and through the application of relevant international and regional instruments and arrangements agreed on the basis of uniform or reciprocal legislation and internal laws, to the widest extent possible.

Cooperation entails developing interstate initiatives and complex approaches, uniform recommendations on migration, and the implementation of concrete actions.

Measures and programmes to be implemented in the context of cooperation include the following anti-trafficking actions:

- Analysis of factors underlying the formation of demand for exploitative labour and commercial prostitution, along with an analysis of legislative, strategic and other measures;
- Development of programmes which create various opportunities, such as basic literacy, education and vocational training, especially among women and other vulnerable groups;
- Expansion of educational opportunities for children and a reduction in the number of children not attending school;

\footnote{19 Երեմյան Ա., Թումասյան Դ., Ղամբարյան Ա., Պետրոսյան Տ. Հայաստանի Հանրապետությունում մարդու թրաֆիքից և շահագործման դեմ պայքարի իրավական հիմունքները: Երևան, 2011թ., էջ 224}
• Providing potential migrants with necessary information concerning the dangers of migration (exploitation, debt bondage, threats to life and safety, incurable sexually transmitted diseases) and legal migration opportunities;
• Awareness campaigns to inform the public about the dangers of human trafficking;
• Research and changing policies which are causing people to migrate and become engaged in the forced labour;
• Study ways of creating better migration opportunities to exclude legalized profit or labour exploitation. Labour migration promoted by the state should be based on relevant mechanisms in force to protect migrants’ rights;
• Strengthen law-enforcement authorities responsible for arresting and prosecuting traffickers;
• Take measures to reduce vulnerability by granting all people identification papers, birth, citizenship, marriage or other certificates.

These steps trafficking are not aimed at targeting the external manifestations of human trafficking, but rather reveal and eliminate its root causes. This strategy is based on the fact that demand is one of the key triggers of trafficking. Therefore, state and international organization action programmes are focusing on reduction, on the gradual elimination of factors which increase vulnerability to trafficking, and on all kinds of triggers including inequality, poverty, discrimination and prejudice.

Cooperation with civil society means that state authorities and public officials should cooperate with non-governmental organizations, other competent entities and civil society. IOM collaborates closely with governmental, intergovernmental and non-governmental partners, as well as with research institutions and the private sector in order to support and provide migrants in trouble, i.e. refugees, displaced persons or victims of trafficking, with humanitarian aid. In 1994, IOM initiated its anti-trafficking actions; so far, it has implemented over 800 programmes in 100 countries and assisted more than 20,000 victims of trafficking worldwide. The primary objective of IOM is to prevent trafficking,
to protect its victims and to provide them with the possibility of safe repatriation and reintegration. *The entire anti-trafficking activity of IOM is based on the principle of ensuring the well-being of victims.*

**E. Practical guidelines**

*How to avoid human trafficking:*

- Before accepting any tempting offer of employment, study or marriage in Armenia or abroad from friends or casual acquaintances, discuss all details with your family, relatives and experts. Do not give anybody your identification papers. As a rule, offers on quick, easy and high income are false. One should be prudent.
- Do not trust announcements offering jobs, study or marriage abroad posted in different parts of the city (village) or published in the newspapers and on the Internet. First of all, verify and check the information provided in such announcements.
- Find out whether companies inviting you abroad and their local partner agencies (tourism, marriage, employment and students exchange agencies) are engaged in legal activity.
- Surf the Internet to find the address of the inviting company and consult with representatives of organizations fighting human exploitation.
- Find out whether local partner agencies are authorized to run their business.
- When abroad, do not accept any suspicious gifts and do not undertake additional obligations.
- Before taking any job offer in your home country or abroad, learn about the working conditions, accurate addresses, contacts and your rights as a young worker.

*If you intend to go abroad:*

- Do not give anybody your passport. You must always have your identification papers on you.
• Give your relatives and friends detailed information on your temporary residence abroad (your address, phone numbers), information on your employer and addresses of your friends living abroad.

• Tell your relatives exactly when and how you will contact them. Always keep in touch with your relatives.

• Leave a photocopy of your passport, a duplicate contract signed with the employer and a recent photo of you at home. Always take with you a photocopy of your passport and keep it in a different place, so that, if you lose the original, you will encounter no difficulty in getting a new one it.

• Remember to write down and take with you abroad the addresses and phone numbers of Armenian embassies and consular services. If in trouble or threatened, seek help from the embassy of Armenia, as well as from local police.\footnote{Ս.Պետրոսյան, Ռ.Մուրադյան, Ս.Խաչատրյան, Հ.Խաչատրյան, Կ. Նահապետյան, Թրաֆիքինգ (մարդկանց շահագործում).Ձեռնարկ ուսուցիչների համար, ՄՄԿ,Երևան, 2010}

• There are many non-governmental organizations and agencies known for their enormous efforts to help people facing difficult situations abroad. Find out their addresses in advance.

• The term of your stay in a foreign country is specified in your entry visa. Violating your visa regulations will make it impossible for you to go abroad in the future.

• Remember that even a basic knowledge of a foreign language will significantly facilitate your stay abroad and help you in difficult situations.

**If you are going to sign a contract to work or study abroad:**

• Sign the contract in Armenia and not after arriving in the country of destination.

• Make sure that the contract is drawn in your native language or another language you know well enough to understand all details and provisions.
• Do not sign the contract on the spot; take it away with you from the agency, re-read it calmly and show it to relevant experts.

• Make sure that your contract stipulates the exact terms of your future work (study), place and time (as well as remuneration if it is a labour contract).

• If dissatisfied with contract provisions, do not sign it.

• Make sure that the contract is signed by the director or the president of the recruiting company. If signed by an interim officer, for example, the deputy director, vice-president or other person, ask for documents attesting that the person is authorized to sign the contract, i.e. director’s or president’s order, or the power of attorney (notarized and stamped).

• Make a copy of the signed contract (preferably of all relevant documents) and leave it with your family or relatives.

RESEARCH PAPER TOPICS

1. Anti-trafficking actions
2. Anti-trafficking preventive measures and directions
3. Analysis of stereotypes and biases deeply rooted in the public mind
4. The role of mass media in preventing human trafficking
5. Analysis of factors triggering the vulnerability of young people to trafficking
6. Social alienation of minors as vulnerability to trafficking
7. Trafficking and children in Armenian orphanages and special schools
8. Minors as potential victims of human trafficking
9. Cooperation in anti-trafficking actions
10. Ways to find employment abroad and how to avoid human trafficking?
11. Public attitudes, approaches and tendencies towards human trafficking in Armenia and abroad (comparative analysis)
12. The role of the International Organization for Migration in anti-trafficking actions

DISCUSSION TOPICS

1. Globalization: challenge or achievement of the 21st century?
2. Pros and cons of working abroad
3. Demand drives trafficking
4. Do men and women enjoy equal rights?
5. Forewarned is forearmed
6. Prostitution is an occupation just like any other
7. Foreign countries, foreign peoples – the risks of employment abroad
8. Easy income: myth or reality?
TOPIC 2. SUPPORT AND PROTECTION OF TRAFFICKING VICTIMS

Tolerance and a victim-centered approach are prerequisites for combating human trafficking. Any anti-trafficking action must focus on the protection of victims’ rights and best interests. Crime detection must by no means jeopardize victims and their relatives or infringe on their rights. Therefore, support and protection of victims are essential in any anti-trafficking action. This aspect of combating trafficking entails the following measures:

- Identification and repatriation of victims;
- Support and protection of victims.

IOM plays a great role in anti-trafficking efforts by providing direct assistance to the victims of trafficking. IOM is an international organization which identifies trafficking victims and makes arrangements for their voluntary repatriation through its international network. Today, victims of trafficking are identified by means of a questionnaire developed by IOM.

In Armenia, the entire process of victim identification and referral is regulated by the National Referral Mechanisms for the Victims of Trafficking approved under Governmental Decree N 1385-A of 20 November 2008. The procedure is aimed at supporting victims of trafficking by referring them to the competent authorities. The need for such referral relates to their protection, accommodation, professional, medical and psychiatric help, counselling, education and training, social integration, etc.

The National Referral Mechanisms for Victims of Trafficking define the collaboration between public agencies and partner non-governmental organizations, and specifies their actions to detect and identify victims. The following competent authorities of the Republic of Armenia are responsible for these mechanisms:

- Ministry of Labour and Social Issues;
- Ministry of Foreign Affairs;
- Ministry of Health;
• Ministry of Territorial Administration;
• National Security Service;
• Police of the Republic of Armenia.
Partner non-governmental organizations are engaged in anti-trafficking activities; their collaboration with relevant public agencies is set forth in MOUs.

Upon returning home, victims of trafficking face numerous problems and difficulties. The following issues, *inter alia*, deserve a special mention:

1. Social and economic status;
2. Legal protection;
3. Mental and physical health;
4. Reintegration and re-socialization.

Moreover, due to a lack of proper support and opportunities, some victims are again exposed to violence and exploitation and fall back into the vicious circle of trafficking.

Therefore, it is necessary to recognize that the support provided to victims under the national referral mechanisms can only be effective *through the collaboration and cooperation of state authorities, non-governmental organizations and organizations which are stakeholders in this process*. Considering that *victims of trafficking need sympathy and compassion and should by no means be condemned or prosecuted*, the national referral mechanisms for the victims of trafficking stipulates the following coherent and consecutive actions:

• Repatriation of victims of trafficking, their reception at the airport, and if necessary, escort throughout travel;
• Personal protection and security;
• Social, psychological and medical help;
• Legal aid;
• Restoration of documents;
• Assistance to resume or continue education in appropriate educational institutions (school, higher education institution);
• Vocational training or assistance to find new employ;
• Assistance with reintegration into the labour market;
• Assistance with other personal needs.

The efficiency of assistance is highly dependent on to what extent social skills of victims are developed and how much importance they place on starting a new life.

**Consequences of trafficking**

The nature of trafficking implies very negative consequences for its victims. Even if they manage to escape from captivity and return home, their problems remain unsolved. Victims need rehabilitation treatment to restart a normal life and leave behind the painful experience of humiliation, negligence, physical and psychological violence they have suffered.

As stated above, human trafficking has multiple serious and negative implications on various aspects of a victim's life:

1. Social and economic status;
2. Reintegration and re-socialization;
3. Legal protection;
4. Mental and physical health;
5. Life and safety.

Often, upon their return, victims of trafficking face problems related to lack of accommodation, unemployment and financial difficulties, as well as negligence, societal condemnation, marginalization, isolation and re-integration difficulties. A great many victims of trafficking also fear for their own life and the safety of their family members.

Victims of trafficking often have serious health problems. Living and working in densely populated accommodation and unsanitary conditions means that victims can easily catch infectious diseases. Constant starvation brings about indigestion, stomach ulcers and severe tooth decay. Heavy and permanent toil results in cardiovascular and spinal damage. Victims of trafficking are exposed to violence and beating, which are likely to cause damage to internal organs. This is a particular problem for prostitutes,
who are severely beaten but in a way which does not affect their good looks. Victims of sexual violence often suffer from incurable sexually transmitted diseases.

Additionally, victims of trafficking face grave mental health problems. They frequently find themselves isolated from society as they avoid sharing their experiences, keep them in secret, or behave as if nothing happened. Many victims have been terrorized and continue to live in constant fear of violence; they are unable to relax and rest and refuse to trust others. They frequently fall into fits of depression and are prone to suicide.

In some cases, victims of sexual exploitation suffer from post-traumatic stress syndrome which results in:

- Tendency to relive traumatic events, memories recur of the terror experienced, apathy towards thinking and speaking about trauma, emotional numbness.
- Indifference and self-isolation, lack of interest in activities which used to bring pleasure and satisfaction, feelings of isolation and alienation, insensitiveness (emotional numbing), inability to show the care they feel for their close relatives, and despair.
- Nervousness, irregular sleep patterns, short and interrupted dream cycles, hyper-arousal, fits of uncontrollable anger, lapses in concentration, and hyper-vigilance.

**RESEARCH PAPER TOPICS**

1. Principles and approaches to support and protect victims of trafficking
2. The role of civil society in supporting and protecting trafficking victims
3. Consequences of human trafficking and the difficulties faced by its victims
4. Identification and voluntary repatriation of victims of trafficking
5. Prerequisites for effective protection of and support for trafficking victims
6. Identification and assessment of societal attitudes towards trafficking victims in Armenia

DISCUSSION TOPICS

1. “I will never fall victim to human trafficking because…”
2. Victims of human trafficking: tolerance or condemnation?
3. If you seek help from someone, everybody will learn about it…
4. Seeking help from law-enforcement authorities is fraught with risks for victims of trafficking
5. Everyone is responsible for his/her own choice of income (education) and its implications
6. Regular people never fall victim to human trafficking
Students work in groups on different aspects of the same topic. Then the groups summarize their results and present them to the rest of the class.

The “jigsaw method” refers to cooperative learning. Cooperative learning means team work, i.e. working in pairs or small groups to generate new ideas, concepts or personal views and to solve and research problems related to the general topic by combining efforts. This method differs from others as students are engaged in mutual peer training, that is to say, they teach and learn from each other. However, group work itself is not considered cooperative learning. The authors of this teaching method, the Johnson brothers, distinguish the following characteristics of cooperative learning:

1. Positive interdependence: Students feel that they need each other’s help to do their general assignments. The trainer can encourage positive interdependence by setting goals which are both individual and collective. (For example, “Teach and make sure that each member of the group learns new things”), common awards (scores for group progress), distribution materials (each group should receive a large sheet of paper, several members of each group should be given some passages with relevant information), and identification of roles (summarizing, facilitating, supplementing, timing).

2. Individual assessment: Progress of each student is assessed on a regular basis and the results obtained are added to their scores and those of the whole group. For the purpose of individual assessment, the trainer can give students individual assignments or randomly choose group members to answer a question on behalf of the entire group. When making such assessment the trainer should be prudent enough to create a friendly environment: in fact,
this method aims to emphasize students’ achievements and by no means the degree of their contribution to the general progress of their groups. Each student is responsible for demonstrating the assignment completed by the group.

3. **Face-to-face interaction**: Group members are close to each other and engage in dialogue.

4. **Emphasizing social skills**: Special attention is paid to development of communication skills, which enables the groups to collaborate, that is to say, to listen to each other’s suggestions, help and encourage one another. The trainer’s aim is to instill such skills in learners in the same manner as academic knowledge. Cooperation covers the following processes: management, decision making, confidence building, communications, and conflict management.

5. **Group analysis**: Members of each group assess their joint efforts and target issues that need review.

6. **Interactive assignment**: The main requirement of the task is to teach others and is comprised of all of the elements above.

The jigsaw method has many variations.

**Jigsaw – 1**

**Methodology**

1. Break down the topic into parts.
2. Form cooperative groups of 4-5 students.
3. Number the members of cooperative (main) groups by 1, 2, 3, etc.
4. Group members with identical numbers are joined into new “expert” groups (1,1,1…2,2,2…etc). Each expert group has its own assignment (for example, if the teaching material is broken down into parts, then the first expert group should work on the first part, the second group on the second part, and so forth).
5. Students rejoin their “main” groups, introduce the material studied in their “expert” group and thus assume the role of trainers. Students share with each other everything they learned themselves and thus join and enhance their knowledge.

6. The “main” groups introduce the entire topic to their remaining classmates using their own method in 5-10 minutes.

7. To sum up the topic, the trainer can give students various tasks. For instance, “What was the most important part?”, “Please express briefly the basic idea of the topic”, “What was the last issue discussed by the group?”, etc. This will enable students to summarize the material and assess it from different perspectives.

Jigsaw – 2

The essence of the method:
Break down the teaching material into two parts:

1. Ask students to work in pairs to study the material. They will work in pairs throughout the lecture.

2. Tell students that they will have to read the material in special ways. In the long run, they should understand the entire material, but for the time being, they should focus on the first passage. Although both students in pairs should read the same passage, they should have different assignments and roles.

3. Each partner is assigned the task to choose his/her role: one chooses the role of the lecturer, the other that of a questioner.

The lecturer carefully reads the passage, summarizes its contents, reviews it, takes notes, thinks on ways to introduce the material to the students and identifies key points. Upon fulfilling his/her assignment, the student retells the passage to his/her partner in his own words.
The student assuming the role of a questioner also reads through the passage. After listening to the lecturer, the latter asks questions about the contents of the passage to uncover details, clarify the situation and obtain new information: “What do you think about this?”, “Can you remember mentioning…?”, “What did the text say concerning...?”

4. Ask students working in pairs to read the passage according to their roles and discuss it.

5. Ask students to read and discuss the second passage after exchanging their roles: now the lecturer assumes the role of the questioner, and the latter that of the lecturer.

6. After a thorough study of the material, the pairs should form larger groups to discuss ways of processing information and introducing the material to the group.

7. Presentation of the material: there are different ways to present the material. Optimal forms include using illustrative classifiers.

8. Each illustration can be greeted with applause.
CASE STUDY

Method description

“Case study” used in pedagogical methodology means a teaching approach which requires the active participation of students in resolving problem situations. The trainer gives to a learner a description of a situation or case containing facts or information related to the subject in question. Learners analyze these facts and information, assess the essence of the problem, take a decision and communicate it to their group members.

Such cases can be taken from real-life situations, or developed and chosen by the trainer, the class or an individual group or student. A case study and its final presentation can last for a single lesson or for the entire academic year. Cases may include true or fictional stories, facts or data. The trainer must use cases that are mostly incomplete and unfinished so that participants can analyze and discuss them, express their own conjectures and viewpoints, make appropriate conclusions and express their opinions. In order to facilitate discussion or examination, such cases should be open-ended. Cases discussed in class can be short and simple or long and complex (i.e. if studied throughout the academic year).

Examination of particular cases is of paramount importance as it enables students to deal with real-life situations and thereby promotes their active participation and enhances their ability to find new solutions.

Types of cases:

1. Complete cases are those based on real facts. Such cases are used only for analysis as their solutions are predetermined; however, students may come up with their own new solutions.

2. Incomplete cases are those with unclear results. In fact, such cases may be unresolved in real life; however, the trainer may again omit facts from the actual storyline. Students are asked to advance conjectures and suggest solutions.
3. Fictional cases are invented by the trainer. Such cases can be either complete or incomplete. Fictional cases must resemble real and complex situations; however, they should not be too intricate so that students do not encounter difficulties in completing their assignments.

4. Real facts include news, articles, reports, facts and statistical data, interviews, passages from historical books, counterarguments, literary notes, and video and audio records.

When you choose cases for discussion, please follow the guidelines below:

1. Cases must be closely connected with students’ life experience and knowledge.
2. Assignments must be complex and diverse.
3. Assignments must not imply a single correct answer such as “yes” or “no”.

Method application:

1. Present the case;
2. Give students some time to look through the case;
3. Identify questions and problems to be discussed in order to find adequate solutions;
4. Give students some time to find solutions;
5. Let students offer their own solutions and answer relevant questions;
6. Discuss all possible solutions and answers;
7. Ask students what new things they learned;
8. Ask students how relevant the case described is with regard to their own environment;
9. Summarize the discussion.

Case Study Management

1. Hold discussions in small groups (one case can be thoroughly studied by a group of 4-6 students). The case examined should be challenging enough to invite students’
active participation. When possible, each group should be asked to reach a general agreement on the subject of the discussion.

2. Develop the discussion. The trainer should frame some questions stimulating in-group discussions. Special attention must be paid to the order in which the questions are asked. First, ask questions which require participants to express their judgements regarding the cases discussed. Further questions may require the analysis of comparisons, assessments, observations or conjectures (versions). Final questions will require students to express their own opinions on the problem discussed. Simple answers, like “yes” or “no”, must be avoided at all times.

3. Sum up the discussion and compare the answers of different groups.

4. Students should not work in groups all by themselves without the assistance of the trainer.

**Advantages of the methods:**

- Develops analytical thinking of students;
- Develops problem-solving skills;
- Helps students enhance their knowledge;
- Develops question-framing skills;
- Develop the ability to find solutions in complex and ambiguous situations;
- Develops the ability to distinguish between primary and secondary issues.

**Difficulties of the method:**

- Real or invented cases may be too complicated for students to consider and thus hamper the solution-finding process;
- Questions may be framed in a manner that diverts students from the essence of the problem instead of facilitating a solution.
PROJECT METHOD

Project method is a strategy which facilitates cooperative learning techniques. Below are the primary objectives of teaching and training techniques which employ project method:

- *To stimulate student’s self-improvement through new experiences gained and new knowledge applied.* Students participating in training projects learn how to carry out research, to gather data from various sources, to make sense of information flows, to select necessary teaching materials, to distinguish between primary and secondary issues, to be able to precisely and consistently express themselves in writing, to receive and send (impart) large pieces of text, digital and graphic information, to analyze the data received, and to suggest new ideas.

- *To promote mutual cooperation between students while carrying out their research.* It should fully meet the conditions necessary for efficient work in group.

According to content, the following types of research project can be distinguished:

- Projects with one subject including materials on that subject;
- Projects with several subjects;
- Projects which transcend all subjects.

A research project can represent a *summary* when its results are used to assess to what extent the students comprehend the teaching material. A research project can also be *current* when only one part of the teaching material is used for self-education and project-related activity.

From an organizational perspective, including research projects in didactic processes presents difficulties. In planning the academic year, trainers should choose central or innovative topics which can be taught using the project method. They should then outline some 15-20 topics for both individual and group work, as indicated in the curriculum.
Stages of project method

• Choose a topic for the project;
• Frame the problem;
• Create a working group;
• Pose questions about the research and assign roles;
• Facilitate independent group work and research;
• Hold regular discussions on the results achieved;
• Introduce the results achieved by the group;
• Evaluate the results of both individual and group work;
• External assessment, analysis and summary;
• Plan further work.

Encourage students to work using the project method

1. Preparatory stage
   • Organizational activities;
   • Work planning;
   • Development of evaluation criteria.

2. Training stage
   • Review of evaluation criteria;
   • Review of teaching materials;
   • Independent research work;
   • Evaluation.

3. Final stage
   • Presentation of results;
   • Assessment of presentation;
   • Organizational activities.

Presentation of results through the project method

• Choose the form of presentation (booklet, videotape, website, PowerPoint presentation);
• Organize the event for the presentation of results;
• Assess the presentation of results.
Examples of results presentation for completed projects

1. Opening address

- Welcoming address of the project manager (the story and development of the project);
- Announcing the order of presentations by participating groups.

1. Presentations by groups

After the presentation of each group, others discuss and assess its work and:

- Identify three key (successful) points of the presentation;
- Identify two aspects of the presentation that need further elaboration;
- Express your own viewpoint on improving the project;
- Sum up the results of the presentations (use an evaluation table to assess the presentation).

3. General discussions

Speeches given by individuals and guests, followed by an exchange of opinions.

4. Concluding remarks by the project manager

- Summary of evaluations;
- Rewards for active students and participants;
- Planning of follow-up activities and ways to improve students’ work;
- Testimonials.

Results achieved through the project method should be evaluated by:

- Trainer and students;
- External assessment;
- Assessment of a student’s individual work;
- Assessment of students’ group work;
- Awarding prizes to active students.
Assess the presentation of results achieved by the end of the project

During the presentation of project results, fill in an evaluation table. Assess each group’s report according to the standards mentioned below and give it a score. In order to find out the total score of each group, sum up their points.

Assessment standards (sample):

- Project’s link to the curriculum and teaching plan;
- Creative approach and solutions;
- Application of various media;
- Application of new training methods;
- Group work, division of work;
- Graphic design;
- Presentation style;
- Ways the project method is implemented.
ROLE PLAY

Educational techniques designed to prevent human exploitation must be based on achievements of modern educational philosophy as they have an essentially practical objective; instead of focusing on content matter this training should help students to demonstrate their knowledge, integrate it into their life philosophy, and to steer their thoughts and actions in the right direction. This objective prioritizes the principles of authentic learning, when real life is the object and background of learning. It is also important to apply the constructive principle that students should not deal with prepared material; instead, they should have the opportunity to develop their own ideas and approaches through consistent individual work and self-reflection. These two principles require the incorporation of imitation (simulation) and role play into the training process.

Multiple factors contribute to the efficiency of teaching. Examination of key factors reveals that trainers who manage to transform students’ assignments and exercises into role play generally succeed in providing efficient and consistent training. If teaching a subject involves a dramatic experience, the teaching material is better retained by the student (Turner, 2004).

This proves particularly true when teaching complex and subtle issues such as human trafficking.

Immanuel Kant, the German philosopher, believed in the good nature of human beings and insisted that the greatest virtue of man is the ability to empathize and understand others. Kant believed that a person could possess this greater virtue only after achieving harmony with his/her inner world and after thinking both “for the self” and “for others”. Role play is considered to be the best didactic method for developing this ability as it enables individuals to understand not only other people but also their own self. From the perspective of human trafficking, Kant’s idea acquires a new meaning as the students do not distance themselves from problems faced by victims of trafficking or believe that victims are themselves to blame for their misfortune; they instead gain the
ability to empathize with them. This will arguably promote a more humane attitude and more rehabilitation opportunities for victims in real life.

It is important to remember that when examining the concept of trafficking students have to deal with materials on very difficult and taboo issues – prostitution, pornography, beatings, swear words, and psychological pressure – which are impossible to imitate without humiliating human dignity, which is banned by basic legal requirements. However, role play enables trainers to create a safe climate in the classroom for students to examine and even play the roles of prostitutes, pimps and traffickers to feel the burden of their moral choice, experience the emotions of victims and finally develop a certain set of values. For those playing the role of the trafficked, this can help students to identify vulnerabilities and resist manipulators, traffickers and exploiters.

**Proper application of role play helps students:**

- Develop direct communication skills;
- Assess, learn and accept other viewpoints and approaches;
- Understand how decisions of a single person can affect others;
- Study theoretical materials and imagine themselves as people who had to play these roles in real life;
- Develop their ability to manage problems and conflicts.

In social studies, role play makes teaching material more interesting and emotionally involves students in the learning process. In some ways, role play helps students to develop their own fundamental democratic values, for example, the ability to freely express their opinion, to show tolerance, be involved in public life, etc.

Every new role-playing storyline is a new experience for students as they find solutions to problems which before they had only discussed or studied; solutions are not predetermined. Knowledge provided by role play is not received from external sources or learned by compulsion – instead it is a result of personal emotional experience and reflections. In this respect, it is very important that students are able to sum up the results of role play and reflect on
them. By the end of each role-playing exercise, trainers should ask students to answer questions on the events described and to reflect on the goals of the role play. Role play is a serious test for the trainer as it may have many unknown and unfamiliar results, both for the student and the trainer. The trainer should show a creative approach and the ability to create a student-friendly environment in the classroom. The trainer can organize a role-playing activity during a single lesson or multiple lessons. During lengthy simulations and a thorough study of certain topics in the curriculum (e.g. risk groups, types of trafficking, etc.), students may assume certain roles, work on their development and improvement (e.g. recruiters, family members, officials, corrupted persons, judges, etc.).

The influence of role-playing games can also be explained by the cognitive learning theory of Bruner,(1966) who proposed three modes of representation to preserve, to restore, and to apply one's life experience. He distinguished the following modes of representation: effective, iconic (image-based), and symbolic.

The effective mode of representation turns knowledge into action as it is difficult to put an action into words; it is easier to show people how to do something they know. Iconic (image-based) knowledge or concepts relate to other theoretical or emotional systems. Pictures, tables and diagrams are examples of imaginary concepts. The third, the symbolic mode of representation, is the most complex. It is best expressed in written and verbal forms. Sociology predominantly uses the third mode, but its greater efficiency requires the synthesis of all three modes, which increase each other's influence when used together.

Role play enables students to use all three modes to express their viewpoints and ideas when discussing events. Trainers responsible for training on trafficking should also be able to act as “directors” who, according to Bruner, teach children sociology through the third mode of representation. However, when sharing knowledge, it is better to use all three modes and thus create a theatrical atmosphere in the classroom. Trainers who develop role-playing atmospheres and exercises make their students
familiar with the drama inherent to human relationships, history and culture in order to help them internalize contradictions, the psychology of their characters, and the essence of the events.

Trainers acting as directors can use a number of skills to encourage students’ interest and participation in role play, to conduct related researches and to help them develop the ability to guess the order of events, and adopt verbal and written communication skills and caring attitudes to the feelings and ideas of others. Role play, simulation and presentation may help students develop research skills, and to impart importance to their activities and efforts to collect and process information.

Role play enables students to get to know historical periods, places and situations with which they had not previously come into direct contact. Role play scripts lack dialogue; however, the trainer can create a theatrical environment. Students then use their experience and knowledge to give their feedback, i.e. reaction of role players, in such situations. Settings can help students to understand the situation (Morriss, 2001)

Role play can turn the classroom into a fascinating place for students and help them learn about historical and cultural ideas and facts. It can tell students about social relations and help them develop self-perception, understand others and improve their ability to sympathize and feel compassion. However, sometimes this method can create problems. Sometimes students assuming new roles may be so engaged in role play that they no longer distinguish between fantasy and real life; for example, in order to act the part, they are rude, behave indecently, etc. It is the trainer’s primary responsibility to prevent such situations. When considering the concept and undesirable consequences of human trafficking, the trainer must show prudence and make sure that the role play developed for teaching purposes has no adverse effect on students, does not pressurize them, or create a climate of fear and hopelessness.

Trainers should feel they have enough positive emotions and internal resources to turn the classroom into an interesting and fascinating environment for role play and simultaneously keep the
situation under control. At the development and realization stages, role play can require the active participation of students.

Role play must not be viewed as a pastime but rather as a serious and purpose-driven activity. Trainers must remember to prepare their students for their roles, to summarize the results of the role play, and to reflect on them. Thus, trainers should first of all prepare their students. Trainers should feel confident in their actions, i.e. choose appropriate teaching material, develop a precise plan of the role play, prepare students to perform their roles by giving them special assignments, and help them give a sincere and pioneering performance during the role-playing exercise.

During the role-playing exercise it is extremely important that students do not feel discomfort or be in a situation in which they can be mocked by their classmates.

**Types of role play**

There are many ways to classify role play. Classification methods of role-playing exercises are listed below:

**Classification of role-playing exercises**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Form</th>
<th>Content</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Imaginary role play</td>
<td>Role play with students depicting themselves</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Demonstrative role play</td>
<td>Role play with students depicting someone else</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Verbal role play</td>
<td>Role play based on real-life stories</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Behavioural role play</td>
<td>Role play based on fictional stories</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Spontaneous role play</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

- **Imaginary role play** only means that students imagine themselves as fictional characters (i.e. politicians or other persons), while **demonstrative role play** requires them to depict their own selves in real life. Imaginary role play can
be conducted during any lesson. For instance, the trainer can make his/her students familiar with stories about human trafficking and ask them to imagine themselves as the characters in the story. Demonstrative role play is very time consuming; it requires detailed instructions and a special introductory course.

- **Verbal role play** is essentially based on discussions, and is polemic and declarative in nature; however, the key requirement of **behavioural role play** is that students act rather than speak. For example, in verbal role play, the trainer may use some stories retold by victims of trafficking about their emotional experiences and students can improvise to add their own details to those stories.

- **Spontaneous role play** can occur in any setting, and all the trainer can do is steer it in the proper direction. Unlike spontaneous role play, **scripted role-playing exercise** imply a strict sequence; however, in some cases, “actors” may follow instructions and still be free to improvise at the same time.

- **Everybody** can depict himself/herself in a role; however, from a psychological perspective, they feel more at ease when **depicting someone else**. Those who are dealing with the problem of trafficking would rather depict someone else, as unpredictable events could hurt/damage the “actor” who depicts himself/herself as a victim.

- **Trainers** can use **real-life situations in role play**, for example, a trafficker deceives a group of men and takes away their passports. They can also use **fictional situations**, for example, the victim’s ghost or *Doppelgänger* visits those guilty for his/her misfortunes and makes accusations against them.

**Role-playing exercises can be free of planning or have a concrete structure.** These two types have their own subcategories, some of which are detailed below.
Role playing games may be unplanned:
   a) In order to meet the request of a participant;
   b) In order to provide better understanding of the problem discussed;
   c) In order to be spontaneous.

Examples:

a) The trainer and his/her students analyze the difficulties they encountered during the implementation of the project. One of the students complains that people do not wish to hear about human exploitation and refuse to answer his questions. They claim to be exploited throughout all their life and think that this subject is not worth any discussion. The trainer should at once offer to act as an interviewee and initiate dialogue by asking the student to start the conversation. The trainer gives sound reasons so that the student is unable to present any counterarguments. Then the roles change: now the trainer invites the student to interview to another person and prioritize the need to combat trafficking. Later, all students can discuss the interview. The trainer can also ask students to give more convincing reasons. The options suggested also develop into role play. Then, the students again discuss and compare advantages and disadvantages of the proposed options. Sometimes the trainer does not participate in the role play but instead asks students to assume their roles.

b) To facilitate better understanding of the problem, the trainer, for example, can ask students to imagine that they are ministers and to discuss what measures they can take to eliminate trafficking in Armenia.

c) Something has happened at a university and provoked a heated argument among students. The trainer can immediately ask one or two students to assume the role of observers and assess and analyze the situation. They can address questions to the arguing parties, for instance: what would you do, if you were X?
**Planned role playing games:**

1. Presentation;
2. Role-playing exercise “Replace me, please”;
3. Solution to a complicated problem;
4. Groups with three participants;
5. Speech;
6. Role-playing exercise “Empty chair”;
7. Role-playing exercise “Press conference”;
8. Role-playing exercises with “Shadow” actors.

1. **Presentation.** This type of role play is performed by two or more students who present to their classmates or even larger groups a situation (in fact, possible situations are not restricted in number) to provide discussions and conclusions in larger groups. It is clear that successful performance requires serious preparation and acting talent. This role play has a very common subtype: “Correct or incorrect”. This method is when the group first presents a situation where participants behave incorrectly and later, after some discussion, describes the correct behavioural pattern in similar situations. This enables opposing parties to find sound reasons to support their arguments.

2. **“Replace me, please”**. This role-playing exercise reduces any risk of awkwardness for participants to the minimum, as they can ask others to replace them at any moment during the exercise. This is done by dividing a large group into two groups. Each group receives a secret assignment. As a rule, the groups assume opposite roles. Two volunteers (one from each group) then perform role play in front of the whole group. Their performance can last for a maximum of three minutes. Afterwards, every participant of each team takes turns performing the same role. Within three minutes of receiving the role, each participant can raise his/her hand to signal “Replace me, please”. The next participant should at once appear on “stage” and resume the performance.
However, the trainer should avoid replacing players of both teams at the same time; it is better to replace students in turns, so that the game lasts longer. If someone plays longer than planned, the trainer raises his/her hand, and the participant is immediately replaced by someone else. It is convenient to use this method in role play to study victims’ psychological state; this is promoted by initiating conversations between escaped victims and traffickers.

At the end of role play, each participant can be given questionnaires with the following or similar questions:

- Did you like your performance?
- Did you avoid taking part in the role-playing exercise? Was it easy for you to play, for example, a victim’s or trafficker’s role? Why do you think that was?
- Did you wait for a student from the other team to enter the game in order to work in pairs, or it did not make any difference with whom you played?
- Did your fill three minutes or did you leave the exercise before that?
- If you got replaced too quickly, why did you choose to leave the exercise?

3. Solution to a complicated problem. This role-playing exercise is similar to a presentation; however, in this case, participants are offered either few potential options to find a solution in a complicated situation or have no options at all. After receiving preliminary instructions, role players start to improvise, trying to find solutions to a complicated problem during the role play. The audience then declares if the players managed to find appropriate solutions. Solutions can be treated optimistically, pessimistically or realistically.

4. The entire group is divided into subgroups of three students and then the subgroups begin the role play. In each subgroup, two participants act as two parties and the third as an observer. The two parties and the observer receive instructions concerning their roles, and the observer also
receives a questionnaire to assess the role play and its participants. The questionnaire might include the following or similar questions:

- Did the “first” player give a good performance? Please, provide arguments to support your opinion.
- Did the “second” player give an appropriate performance? Please give relevant reasons for your answer.
- Do you think the parties managed to find a solution? Why do you think they were able to?
- Did you learn anything new while observing the role play? If yes, what did you learn?

The presence of observers stimulates participants to treat their roles seriously. Their performance is first discussed by group members and then by all the students.

5. **Speech.** Before the role play, students are asked to write a speech on their own or on behalf of another individual or fictional character, and to deliver it at a certain point in their performance. Speeches are made in front of all the students and then discussed. For example, students may make a speech on behalf of the country’s president or prime minister regarding anti-trafficking actions or on behalf of an independent journalist who condemns the destructive consequences of this crime, etc.

6. **“Empty chair”**. An empty chair is placed in the middle of the classroom to simulate the role of a decision maker or other high-ranking official. Students volunteer to “present” their problems to the chair and highlight new questions. This role-playing exercise can develop into a competition. It can target corrupt police officers and representatives of border control authorities. If the exercise takes the form of a competition, the trainer may select a jury which will assess whether the arguments provided by the group are
convincing enough to indict corrupted officials and form public opinion.

7. “Press conference” requires students to study the behavioural patterns, life experience, mentality and political beliefs of the characters they are to play in advance. During their performance, the audience plays the part of journalists. The “journalists” ask the characters certain questions, who do their best to resemble their protagonists in their answers.

8. “Shadow” role players can be present in simple role-playing exercises which involve one to three participants. The “shadow” is also a character, one which assumes the role of the inner voice or conscience of a certain participant. Unlike participants who follow previously received instructions, the “shadow” acts spontaneously and is guided by his/her intuition or a character’s viewpoint. If participants express an opinion, the “shadow” can tell the audience that their real opinion is absolutely different from the one they just voiced. This method allows the audience to consider an individual from two different perspectives. However, the participants and the “shadow” may sometimes have heated debates; this, in fact, makes such methods complicated. However, if the student acting as a “shadow” is a careful observer, this role play is likely be effective. The trainer can sometimes even forbid any dialogue between participants and the “shadow”, as if they existed in parallel worlds.

“Shadows” can accompany traffickers who promise their victims a bright future and use the participant’s voice to express their real intentions. Seeing the clear contradiction between intention and conduct helps students better imagine the “loose morals” of traffickers.

In addition to the general forms of role-playing exercises described above, there are more complex forms. Problems related to human trafficking can be examined by using the following:
1. **Mock trials.** Students should accurately imitate a trial held some time in the past. The more scrupulous the preparation, the better the imitation will be. Archives and publications will be of great help to achieve this.

2. **Role play of trials with public verdicts.** This type of role-playing imitation of trials is similar to mock trials; the only difference is that the verdict can be changed.

3. **Trials of fictional characters.** Mock trials help students shape clearer ideas about justice, honesty and other issues, as well as satisfy their natural thirst for knowledge and use the occasion to get rid of biased opinions. For instance, students can judge the character of Samvel Poulshatyan, the hero of the novel “The Rich Are Having Fun” by great Armenian writer Muratsan, who bought a girl and sexually abused her.

4. **Trials concerning current conflicts and problems.** Legal cases are based on video materials, news releases, and opinions of participants’ family members and relatives on current events. Current events are of great importance and relevance to students; therefore, they try to hold their own trial. For example, they can judge a father who refuses to take his daughter back after she fell victim to trafficking, as he claims that he would die of shame.

5. **Students create a new scenario and turn it into role play.** This is a very creative process which enables students to make up stories involving crimes, victims, witnesses, evidence and offenders charged with a crime. In this case, it is essential that students turn their knowledge of theory into practice. To do so, they also need a broad-minded trainer with good investigative skills. If the crime is too complicated and the students cannot hold a trial, they should instead resume the investigation and try to learn how competent legal officials would have acted in similar situations.
6. “Reader’s Theatre” (Turner, 2004). This role-playing method consists of groups of students transforming a piece of narrative writing into role play. The key point of this method is dramatic plot planning. To transform such a narrative into role play, students should perfectly understand the characters, the situation and remember their primary goals, the themes, story and plot lines. In fact, they will rewrite the story by turning the narrative episodes into dialogues. They should be careful enough to understand which information refers to which character and how to develop it into a dialogue or a monologue. After developing and rewriting the narrative, students can perform it several times. For example, they could perform the story *Traded innocence* by Raffi, or the fairy tale *Anahit* by Ghazaros Aghayan, particularly the episode describing how its characters fall victim to human exploitation. The performance can have intervals, so that students can discuss problems of trafficking in persons in between scenes.

**Reflection or consideration following the role-play**

Role play is a very efficient teaching method; however, it is incomplete without the consideration stage, i.e. students’ reflections on their own actions. *This process is called consideration or reflection, which enables the trainer and his/her students to use debriefing sessions in order to reveal the knowledge gained.*

Many researchers emphasize the importance of holding debriefing sessions after role-playing games as an essential way to maximize their efficiency. (Gillespie, 1973, in Petranec et al, 1992). Most role-play exercises are not didactic in nature; therefore, the trainer needs to use the method of reflection to help his/her students consider their behaviour patterns, role-play methods and the similarities between them. Role-playing exercises should not be viewed as a deviation from day-to-day class activities. In fact, they can play an integral role and aim to facilitate the debriefing
session. As role players consider problems and reflect on them after the activity, they acquire essential skills to deal with real-life situations.

During debriefing sessions, trainers fulfill a completely different function. They create an atmosphere of sincerity and are open to new ideas. During debriefing sessions, trainers initiate discussions and encourage every opinion. They can face some difficulties if they lean towards the more didactic style of teaching (implying passive roles for students). The debriefing session should not be trainer-orientated. Trainers should give students some time for reflection and raise complex questions. They should encourage students to pay special attention to patterns and draw parallels between role play and real life.

Hankinson (1987) and Hsu (1989) offer the following course to hold debriefing discussions. They believe that the debriefing session is based on “Four Es” (Events, Emotions, Empathy and Explanations).

The best way to initiate a discussion is to ask participants to describe all their experiences. Any students wishing to do so may speak out. If necessary, students may elaborate on details. At this stage, the trainer should try to turn the discussion into an analysis.

After the students have shared their experiences, the discussion should then target another important issue, namely students’ feelings brought about by the role-playing experience. The trainer should be very careful when asking students to reveal their feelings. If students fail to find the appropriate words to express their emotional experiences, the trainer should be the first to offer a list of synonyms. The trainer, then, aims to create an atmosphere of trust, i.e. an atmosphere where all feelings and ideas are respected. Even if students discuss some unpleasant feelings, the trainer should listen to them and appreciate their frankness.

*Events and emotional experiences can provide a lot of information.* To help students learn a lesson from a particular situation, the trainer should turn to the third important stage: empathy. He/she should also offer to discuss the simulation from various perspectives.
The trainer will encourage participants to imagine themselves in someone else’s place and to perceive the world as they would do. Opposite approaches to the situation are both acceptable. During the role play, it is important to understand different opinions.

Reflection on role play is completed through the *explanation* or *analysis* stages, which can take various forms. The trainer should encourage participants to explain the triggers of their actions or experiences. Students should detail their role play and the primary aim of the exercise. They then draw parallels between role play and real life, and discuss similarities and differences. Participants should reflect on the following question: “Do people make the same decisions in real life?” Finally, students may also discuss abstract theories, new actions and experiences. They can comment on these theories and then find logical similarities with their particular role play.

The author of the second approach to debriefing, Linda Lederman (1992), offers a model stipulating that mental processes should pass through the following three stages:21

1. Access to coordinated mental and analytical processes;
2. Personification of analysis and life experience, search of one’s place in one’s own inner world;

One can immediately notice that both debriefing approaches share common features; this means that educational experts already have a general idea about how to debrief students; trainers should be able to employ and mix the three-stage method and four “Es” to effectively debrief the participants of role-playing exercises.

Lederman suggests that trainers who debrief students (debriefers) may break down the first stage of debriefing session into sub-stages in order to facilitate the reflection process. Teachers can choose the following sub-stages: 1) invite participants to join a sincere discussion; 2) define rules of the discussion (mental processes) to be followed by the given group; 3) assess expectations of the students.

---

21 For more informations, see the website of the Armenian Ministry of Foreign Affairs: http://www.mfa.am/hy/ministry/
groups and ask them to describe the events; 4) describe the events – participants can explain their actions and the reasons underlying them.

During the second stage, with the help of their trainer, students try to describe the direct impact of their experiences on their personality. They discuss what they experienced and felt while playing their roles and how they perceived someone else’s problem and its complexity. Students should also consider whether they managed to solve the problem (if there was indeed a problem) and understand the reasons influencing people’s conduct in similar situations.

In the third stage, the debriefer again helps students to sum up the role play and understand the situations in which they can apply their new knowledge, skills and ability to empathize. At this stage, the trainer asks them the following question: “What did we learn after the role play?” Students try to recall and compare some facts, and then sum up the new experience they gained during the lesson.

Upon completing the debriefing analysis, students may then comment on mutual assessment of their work if, for example, they identified the group that managed to plausibly communicate an idea or event. In some role plays, the exercise may be performed again after the analysis. Therefore, an adequately chosen order of debriefing and analysis is not only aimed at facilitating students’ comprehension of the material in question, but also at developing their introspection skills and the links between life experience and training.
LECTURE METHOD: ADVANTAGES AND DISADVANTAGES

Lecture is a popular method of traditional teaching (Toghanyan et al, 2008:110). Despite many new methods available today, lecturing continues to be fundamental for the active communication of teaching material. In fact, lectures are a monologue, namely the verbal communication of information and teaching material by a teacher or trainer sharing information or knowledge with a group of students who are expected to listen carefully, comprehend and retain such knowledge. In this case, communication is unidirectional, passing from trainer to student. Therefore, this is arguably a passive process. A lecture is supposed to last as long as the focus of the audience can be maintained, namely 20 minutes; however, it may last longer in some cases and entail changes in style, form and speed of presentation (for example with breaks for questions and handouts).

Lecture suggests a passive teaching method and therefore requires techniques to guarantee the maximum involvement of students in the learning process. Choose an interesting and motivating topic can keep your students actively involved. Such a lecture is expected to have an unpredictable, remarkable and sometimes contradictory and ‘provocative’ introduction containing an open question, an appropriate quotation (a curious fact), a fact, a link to reality (real-life examples, references to personal experience of students), another fact, and a motivating conclusion.

To facilitate better understanding and comprehension of the teaching material, the lecture must follow a certain sequence, so that students can ponder over each step, sum up every individual section, and highlight and review the focal points of the lecture.

Questions, specifically rhetorical questions that do not imply giving any answers, serve to highlight the trainer’s idea and promote students’ thinking and focus. This is communicated through questions answered by the trainer himself/herself. Every new question raised by the trainer prompts students to react even if they are unable to respond at once.
To invite students’ active participation in the learning process, the trainer may suspend the lecture at some point (individual or final parts of the lecture), ask them questions or initiate a discussion.

Various visual aids such as illustrations, diagrams, graphics and notes on the board facilitate comprehension of the teaching material communicated in the lecture.

Also, active involvement can be achieved through the trainer’s speech, intonation, pitch, pauses, mimics and gestures.

Advantages and disadvantages of the method

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Advantages of the method</th>
<th>Disadvantages of the method</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1. This method fits well (quickly and simultaneously) with large groups of people</td>
<td>1. Passive learning</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2. Conventional division of content facilitates comprehension</td>
<td>2. Lack of review techniques and feedback makes it difficult to assess students’ comprehension</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3. Exact timing and control</td>
<td>3. The trainer drives the entire process alone</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
DEBATE

Debate is counted among essential collaborative techniques in open, democratic societies (Khachatryan et al, 2005). Using debate as a means to solve social problems is a characteristic of developed, democratic societies.

The critical role of debating methods in modern teaching is driven by public demand. Debate is an interactive, purpose-orientated, emotional, and fundamental method. It is interactive in the sense that many ideas and arguments are formulated and supported through communication between participants. Debate is purpose-orientated in the sense that the students focus on finding a solution to a particular problem. Debate is emotional in the sense that it would lack efficiency if students remained indifferent to the matter of discussion. Debate is fundamental in the sense that it helps students not just to speak out, but express well-reasoned ideas.

Debate plays a vital role in meeting the fundamental standards of education. The famous educationalists Newman and Wehlage identified five key standards or benchmarks of education. Two of them, namely “higher order thinking” and “substantive conversation between students” are directly related to debate. Principally, debate opens up a unique opportunity for students’ self-expression to develop higher order thinking. The debate also creates a perfect environment for the generation of new ideas. Finally, the content of the debate may lay the foundations for the developed thinking of students.

Debate also relates to the basic civic skills identified by the renowned American civic education specialist Richard Remy. Debates are indeed essential for developing “communication” and “collaboration”.

Forms of debate

**Socratic debate**

*Objective*

Socratic debate is named after the Greek philosopher Socrates. His disciple, Plato, claimed that Socrates favoured the approach of revealing the nature of things by asking questions. Socratic debate is a valuable method for several reasons. Firstly, it promotes students’ learning and participation. Secondly, Socratic debate also develops a trainer’s capacity to frame questions and follow the thinking of his/her students. Thirdly, answering a trainer’s questions helps students to consistently review their attitudes and take their thinking to a new level of quality.

*Method application*

Socratic debate should be used by trainers who seek to develop discernment and good judgement skills in students. It implies no factual statement such as “Please describe the structure of the Athenian state”. Instead, questions like “Was Socrates right to drink poison?” meets the requirements of Socratic debate.

Socratic debate can also be used to address controversial issues without any specific “correct” answer.

*Socratic debate management*

Students should sit in a circle and face each other. Socratic debate requires careful preparation by the trainer. Firstly, the trainer chooses a debate topic and introduction for students. Lectures, references, textbooks and articles can be used for the introduction. The trainer then chooses the first question for the students. Such question must arouse their interest, be open-ended, be general enough to grab their attention, and start the debate on the subject. In Socratic debate, the first question is critical. Therefore, the trainer should have a few questions prepared as the debate may not be triggered by one single question. One of the trainer’s key objectives is to guide the debate by using categorized questions.
Furthermore, the trainer should ask questions to support students’ viewpoints. During Socratic debate, students may also ask questions. At a certain point, the trainer can stop the debate and proceed to the evaluation stage.

**How to evaluate Socratic debate**

Along with other methods, Socratic debate should be evaluated in terms of the stated objective. Usually, this type of debate aims to assess students’ ability to comprehend the teaching material, employ logical reasoning, provide examples to support their opinion, and apply independent thinking to the material learned. Questionnaires and evaluation scales can be used for assessment. If Socratic debate is held regularly, the trainer can also keep a journal or folder for students to share their impressions and the results achieved in their groups. To facilitate such records, students can answer the self-assessment questions below:

**Socratic debate self-assessment questions**

1. Is the teaching material under debate clear to you?
2. State your opinion about the matter of discussion by advancing three arguments presented during the debate.
3. Did you express or support any position during the debate? If no, state the reason.
4. Did you follow the train of thought during the debate? If no, state the reason.
5. What else could students have done to achieve better results during the debate?

Such self-assessment questions help gauge students’ thinking during the debate.

Socratic debate can also be assessed using an evaluation scale. An example is outlined below:
Evaluation scales

**Unsatisfactory**
The student failed to show relevant knowledge, offer or support any idea.

**Minimal**
The student showed knowledge of an argument presented by someone else.

**Adequate**
The student showed sound knowledge of the debate topics, and expressed, made clear, supported and reasoned his/her own opinion.

**Effective**
The student showed sound knowledge of the debate topics, put forward and supported consistently at least one argument and pondered over his/her own ideas.

**Model**
The student showed sound knowledge of the debate topics, expressed, made clear, supported and reasoned his/her own viewpoints on the topics. The student also pondered aloud over his/her own ideas.

**Advantages and difficulties of Socratic debate**

This method promotes active learning through the involvement of students in the teaching process. In fact, the Socratic method is based on fundamental rather than simple questions. Specialists argue that fundamental questions stir up interest in students. This method helps students focus both on content and their reasoning through the development of cognitive skills.

However, the Socratic has its pitfalls, which can cause failure if handled inappropriately. In principle, any debate may take an unexpected turn; this means that the trainer will have to formulate his/her questions as the lesson progresses. In fact, the trainer should always listen to his/her students, frame appropriate questions and briefly manage the class.
**Open debate**

Notwithstanding its numerous advantages, Socratic debate still proves weak as the leading role is reserved for the trainer throughout the process. Open debate, however, may improve the leadership skills of students. This method is especially useful when it precedes written assignments. Studies have shown that students can gain considerable knowledge and later exhibit it in their written assignments. It also proves effective to discuss controversial issues. The trainer should not use open debate if he/she intends to play an active role in the lesson. Moreover, the trainer should try to ask some questions at the beginning of the debate to stir up his/her students’ interest in the topic and then join them at their desks. Students are expected to start and stimulate the debate themselves. The trainer should follow the students throughout the debate with minimal intervention. A trainer’s intervention is required only when students stray from the subject. The aim of an open debate is to provide students with the opportunity to speak out and address the topic of the lesson. Before starting the debate, students must comprehend its objective, as well as establish and follow some rules. It is essential to ensure that every student joins in. There are numerous ways to achieve this. The trainer can give each student three (or more) cards. Whenever any student wishes to speak, he/she must raise the card and take the floor. After that he/she is expected to hand in his/her card to the trainer. After using all of his/her three cards, the student must wait for all his/her group mates to use their cards. Such restriction ensures that students enjoy equal participation and use their cards only if they wish to say something important. If there are no cards available, students can raise their fingers to indicate the number of times they have taken the floor.

*How to assess open debates?*

It can prove quite difficult to assess open debates as they represent relative processes. The trainer can keep a journal for students to share their ideas about the debate. The use of a debate evaluation scale (in other sources, “Debate evaluation” is considered as
an independent method) is of particular interest. Before starting the debate, the trainer hands out a form containing the debate assessment criteria. Both trainers and students who stay outside the debate can assess its course.

*Debate assessment criteria*

The first column features assessment criteria and the second indicates their score. The columns on the right refer to individual students. The trainer may use numbers or names to differentiate between students. The trainer may also add or remove criteria and change the score system to reflect the contents of the debate. However, it is essential to specify no more than 10 criteria (the table below contains more than 10 criteria to provide more options for trainers). It is scientifically proven that the assessor is unable to follow the debate and remain impartial with over 10 criteria to choose from. The use of such evaluation scales can significantly increase students’ capacity for reasoned debate.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Criteria</th>
<th>Scores</th>
<th>1</th>
<th>2</th>
<th>3</th>
<th>4</th>
<th>5</th>
<th>6</th>
<th>7</th>
<th>8</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1. Imparting factual information</td>
<td>+ 1</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2. Reasoning or disproving factual information</td>
<td>+ 2</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3. Expressing own opinion</td>
<td>+ 2</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4. Comparative analysis</td>
<td>+ 1</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5. Timely remark</td>
<td>+ 1</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6. Moving the debate to a higher quality level</td>
<td>+ 2</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Advantages and disadvantages of open debate

Open debate gives students ample opportunities to hone their critical thinking and debating skills. Students feel free to take a more active part in the debate with minimum intervention from their trainer. Additionally, this method displays students’ leadership skills.

Open debate also has some disadvantages. Inattentiveness on the part of the trainer can render the method useless. For instance, not all classes may be ready for a debate if students do not show mutual respect and tolerance towards each other.

The trainer should realize that his/her control over the content of the open debate is limited. This means that for an effective discussion, he/she should choose the right topic. For instance, a
topic on three branches of government is not appropriate for open debate. Instead, the trainer can chose a controversial topic, such as the abolition of the death penalty.

Overall, trainers face a dilemma: they must keep their students on the track (there is a risk that students may simplify the topic) and simultaneous encourage their independent thinking. Therefore, trainers should apply open debate only if the priority is to encourage independent thinking.

**Circular written debate**

“Written debate” is a method of cooperative training and learning. The method ensures the direct involvement and interaction of students and creates a highly favourable and noiseless environment for debates. Its role in developing writing skills cannot be underestimated.

First, divide the audience into 4 groups named, for instance, red, blue, green and yellow. The number of groups depends on how many ideas and statements are being discussed.

**Introduction**

Tell the students that they will examine some thorny issues of public concern, along with some fictional problems, and will form their own opinions using “written debate”.

Each student group is to receive a large sheet of paper containing an idea, statement or phrase written in large letters in red, blue, green or yellow.

Each group is to receive a marker of its colour.

Next, the groups should be invited to read and discuss their statements and write their attitudes and ideas under each question. Make sure that they use only quarter of the paper so that others may have enough writing space to answer questions.

Once the time is up, the trainer asks the groups to stop their discussion and exchange their papers clockwise (first round). With each round, the trainer should add some time for discussion.
The trainer should invite each group to look through the next statement, read the remarks of the previous group, and give their own feedback on the ideas stated rather than the statement in question.
Once the time is up, the trainer must again ask the groups to stop their discussion and exchange their papers clockwise (second round).

The trainer should invite each group to look through the next statement, read the two previous remarks, and give their own feedback on their ideas rather than the statement in question.
Once the time is up, the trainer is to ask the groups to stop their discussion and exchange their papers clockwise (third round).
The trainer should invite each group to look through the key statement on another paper, read the previous three remarks, then formulate and write down their own attitudes.
Once the time is up, the groups exchange their papers clockwise for the fourth time so that each group gets back its original paper.
The students in each group then read the feedback, and discuss and formulate their final position.

**Presentation of papers**
The groups should present their own final papers and detail the feedback given by the other groups. They should also highlight what exactly they changed with regard to their original viewpoint and which of the groups influenced it the most. Opinions of each group should be written in different colours respectively.
The trainer should then invite the students to discuss the viewpoints by questions and answers.

**Debate (political)**
Political debate is counted among the basic types of polemics. Debate is indeed the competitive form of polemics mostly used during election campaigns. The Lincoln-Douglas debate format is probably the most common form of polemics. The name links
back to a series of seven debates between Stephen Douglas and Abraham Lincoln running for the Senate from the State of Illinois in 1859. At the time, Douglas won the elections, while Lincoln was elected US president two years later.

Lincoln-Douglas debate includes two disputing parties; similarly, students can make up two groups. The debate opens with a statement, for example, “All students must wear a uniform”. Some students are expected to support this statement, while others must oppose it. The class is divided into two groups, either reflecting the students’ wishes or on a random basis. If groups are formed randomly, it may happen that students who are against uniforms may instead find themselves in the group of supporters. This is quite normal practice as putting oneself in the shoes of one’s opponents may be essential to better understand their viewpoint.

Stages of debate:

The supporter group (Group 1) presents its arguments (5-6 minutes).

- The opposing group (Group 2) asks questions concerning the arguments (3 minutes).
- Group 1 answers the questions (5-6 minutes).
- Group 2 presents its own arguments against the statement (5-6 minutes).
- Group 1 asks questions concerning the arguments (3 minutes).
- Group 2 answers the questions (5-6 minutes).
- Group 2 presents its counterarguments (5-6 minutes).
- Group 1 presents its counterarguments.

To ensure the full participation of all group members, the trainer can assign the following roles: a **moderator** is assigned to keep order, introduce the debate topic, participants and their roles; a **debater** is assigned to present the arguments of his/her group; a **questioner** is assigned to ask questions on the arguments presented; a **respondent** is assigned to answer the questions
of the opposing group; a presenter of counterarguments is assigned to present counterarguments; a summarizer is assigned to close the debate by presenting the final position of the group.

Debate assessment

An evaluation scale sample to assess the debate is presented below:

Debate evaluation scale

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Criteria</th>
<th>1</th>
<th>2</th>
<th>3</th>
<th>4</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Coherence and clarity</td>
<td>Mostly unclear</td>
<td>Some parts are clear</td>
<td>Mostly clear and well formulated</td>
<td>Absolutely clear and well formulated with precise viewpoints and answers</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Use of arguments</td>
<td>Very few or irrelevant arguments</td>
<td>A few relevant arguments</td>
<td>Mostly relevant arguments</td>
<td>Relevant counterarguments. Viewpoints are supported by arguments.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Use of examples and facts</td>
<td>No or few examples and facts</td>
<td>Some examples and facts</td>
<td>Many examples and facts</td>
<td>Many examples and facts. Examples and facts are used to support arguments.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
### CORNERS

“Corners” is a cooperative exercise aimed at starting a debate and helping students to develop reasoning and presentation skills through group work. This exercise can be an efficient method for holding debates on controversial issues, with the possibility of having two or more viewpoints. During the lesson, students can do the exercise after listening to/reading a text or presentation. The exercise revolves around the students’ capacity to take clear viewpoints and support them. During the exercise, students must be attentive and respectful to each other. They can even change their opinion if they find any argument convincing.

Once students are certain of their position, they build arguments to support it. Next, students form groups in the four corners of the classroom. Supporters gather in one corner of the auditorium, opponents assemble in another corner, while those without a

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>4. Counterarguments</th>
<th>No adequate counterarguments presented</th>
<th>A small number of counterarguments</th>
<th>Several counterarguments</th>
<th>The counterarguments sounded convincing. Viewpoints of the other group received good counterarguments.</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>5. Presentation style (Tone, gestures and efforts to convince the audience)</td>
<td>Some stylistic devices proved unconvincing</td>
<td>Some convincing stylistic devices were used</td>
<td>All stylistic devices were used and mostly proved convincing</td>
<td>All stylistic devices were used and proved convincing</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

CORNERS

“Corners” is a cooperative exercise aimed at starting a debate and helping students to develop reasoning and presentation skills through group work. This exercise can be an efficient method for holding debates on controversial issues, with the possibility of having two or more viewpoints. During the lesson, students can do the exercise after listening to/reading a text or presentation. The exercise revolves around the students’ capacity to take clear viewpoints and support them. During the exercise, students must be attentive and respectful to each other. They can even change their opinion if they find any argument convincing.

Once students are certain of their position, they build arguments to support it. Next, students form groups in the four corners of the classroom. Supporters gather in one corner of the auditorium, opponents assemble in another corner, while those without a
certain position group in the third corner. If there are students who share other viewpoints, they can occupy the forth corner of the room. Group members are given five minutes to exchange, discuss and sort out written arguments by choosing the most convincing ones to support their position. Each group must choose a spokesperson to state its position during the debate.

To start the debate, the groups take turns to present their positions and arguments. After the spokespersons have completed their formal assignments, other group members can also join in. To encourage a more animated discussion and full involvement of all students, the trainer may ask encouraging questions, such as:

- Why does group A disagree with group B?
- Specifically which arguments of group B do you find in conflict with your own position?
- What about students with no position at all?
- Which disputing party provided more convincing arguments to sway you?
- Can you suggest why group B finds the arguments of group A unconvincing?

The trainer should remind the disputing parties that they are free to change their opinion or group during the debate. If this occurs, they should join the group with a more convincing position and move to their corner. The trainer should encourage his/her students to change groups if their opinion has been influenced by another group; group members must try to persuade their friends to stay in their group by coming up with new arguments. Therefore, group members are expected to come up with new arguments to preserve their group and draw more supporters.

After the general discussion, each group is expected to formulate its position and supporting arguments. Each of them should then write down his/her own viewpoint and supporting arguments.
INTERACTIVE SIGN SYSTEM

The interactive sign system is essential for reading texts (especially reference literature) with efficiency. In fact, the interactive sign system (ISS) is an effective tool to control reading comprehension of the teaching material.

V = This confirms my knowledge (I know this).
+ = This is new information (I do not know this).
- = This contradicts my knowledge.
? = This is not clear to me.
! = This is quite interesting and worth discussing.

When used in reading, such signs facilitate active and critical learning through highlighting new, unclear and controversial ideas.

Numerous ISS signs show how actively the reader is involved in the lesson and how efficient his/her reading of the text is.

To comprehend the teaching material better, each student must classify it using the table below.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>V</th>
<th>+</th>
<th>-</th>
<th>?</th>
<th>!</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Later, the trainer may encourage students to exchange their ideas, discuss the teaching material or hold a debate in pairs or groups.

The trainer may also instruct the students to fill in the third and fourth columns by using other sources for further information and thus expand their knowledge.
FOUR ASPECTS

The division of texts into four “aspects” is an interesting methodological technique specifically used for reading texts. Along with other techniques described above, the division into four aspects can be applied to large or small groups, or to individual work. To begin, students need a clean sheet of paper (flipchart) divided into four sections. Primarily, this exercise represents a form of written work for students to note their thoughts in each of the four sections. Two methods for division of texts into four aspects are presented below. The instructions in the sections are not chosen randomly but correspond to comprehension of the teaching material and the development of thinking; therefore, it is pointless to change them. The trainer can of course improve such assignments depending on comprehension and levels of thinking (e.g. Bloom’s Taxonomy24).

Four aspects for division of texts

These tables should be filled in numerical order. If students work individually, each of them must first discuss his/her notes in pairs and then share them with the whole group. The pair or group may also decide to present their notes to the entire audience. The trainer may also prioritize some aspects of the text, story or teaching material and thus draw special attention to the notes in a certain section of the division table that must be prepared, presented and discussed. Furthermore, the division table must be used at the final stage of the training.

BRAINSTORMING

Brainstorming (the free exchange of ideas) is a very common, simple but effective method. As the name itself suggests, the method promotes the free expression of ideas and words associated with the point or matter in question.

This method is used in the learning process to promote free, bold and unchecked statements of thoughts, ideas and opinions. It can be applied both in pairs and in large or small groups. Brainstorming is mostly used at the beginning of a lesson and at the inception stage to remind students of prior knowledge, activate new ideas (what students know or think that they know about a particular topic or material) and stir up interest, as well as transpose their subconscious perceptions to the conscious level and draw parallels between students’ prior knowledge and new material.

At the end of the lesson, students fully examine and comprehend the teaching material and should certainly review the results of brainstorming by clarifying, supplementing and completing the list of prior thoughts and ideas. According to Piaget, this is the only way to change learners’ cognitive structures by integrating new information as new knowledge.

Brainstorming can also be used at other stages of the lesson to hold group discussions or make decisions on any issue. In such cases, the key function of brainstorming is to generate new ideas. While brainstorming always promotes the free flow of ideas by students, this method lasts for an average of no longer than 10 minutes.

Brainstorming greatly enhances the efficiency of a lesson by:

- Promoting the active participation of students, stirring up and maintaining their interest;
- Encouraging new ideas;
- Stimulating creative thinking of students;
- Develops social communication skills.

Additionally, ideas generated during group work prove to be more valuable than individual ones. Ideas are written down during direct interaction between group members (two minds are better than one);

---

25 Bloom, Benjamin S. *Taxonomy of Educational Objectives* (1956). Allyn and Bacon, Boston, MA.
If you use this method, please follow the rules below:

1. Participants should feel free to speak out and say whatever they know or think they know;
2. Students’ thoughts and opinions must be written down or recorded (on a flipchart or on paper);
3. Every opinion voiced must be written down;
4. Every opinion must be written down and considered acceptable, avoiding any criticism;
5. The expressed viewpoints should not be modified;
6. The trainer should give priority to the number of ideas and constantly stimulate their flow, without imposing any control or restrictions;
7. All students should be equally entitled to express their opinion – none of them should be considered superior.

GALLERY TOUR

The gallery tour method in question is used at the end of a lesson or training to summarize teaching material and help students assess their group mates’ work. This method ensures visual presentation, the involvement of all participants in an animated and effective discussion, a combination of various activities, and mobility.

The groups display exhibits (figures, diagrams, tables) which serve as key visual aids for the basic idea behind the topic of discussion. These exhibits are posted on the walls of classrooms or corridors. Groups of students make a tour of the classroom/corridor, examining, discussing each item and listening to the explanations of the authors. Students may take notes, and leave comments and opinions.

After the gallery tour, the groups discuss their papers again to analyze the written comments.
GLOSSARY OF MAIN TERMINOLOGY ON HUMAN TRAFFICKING

1. **Illegal entry** – “[The] [a]ct of crossing borders without complying with the necessary requirements for legal entry into the receiving State” (Art. 3 (b), UN Protocol against the Smuggling of Migrants by Land, Sea and Air, supplementing the United Nations Convention against Transnational Organized Crime, 2000).

2. **Passport or travel document** – an internationally recognised travel document granted by a foreign state or an international organisation [which] entitle[s] the bearer to cross a national border (Art. 3, RA Law on Aliens).

3. **Child** – an individual being below the age of eighteen years unless, under the law applicable to the child, maturity is attained earlier (Art. 1, UN Convention on the Rights of the Child, 1989).

4. **Serious crime** – conduct constituting an offence punishable by a maximum deprivation of liberty of at least four years or a more serious penalty (Art. 2, UN Convention against Transnational Organized Crime, 2000).

5. **Organized criminal group** – a structured group of three or more persons, existing for a period of time and acting in concert with the aim of committing one or more serious crimes or offences established in accordance with this Convention, in order to obtain, directly or indirectly, a financial or other material benefit (Art. 2, UN Convention against Transnational Organized Crime, 2000).

6. **Violence against women** – understood to encompass, but not be limited to, the following:

(a) Physical, sexual and psychological violence occurring in the family, including battery, sexual abuse of female children in the household, dowry-related violence, marital rape, female genital mutilation and other traditional practices harmful to women, non-spousal violence and violence related to exploitation;
(b) Physical, sexual and psychological violence occurring within the general community, including rape, sexual abuse, sexual harassment and intimidation at work, in educational institutions and elsewhere, trafficking in women and forced prostitution;

(c) Physical, sexual and psychological violence perpetrated or condoned by the State, wherever it occurs (Art. 2, UN General Assembly Declaration on the Elimination of Violence against Women, 1993).

7. **Trafficking in persons** – the recruitment, transportation, transfer, harbouring or receipt of persons by means of the threat or use of force or other forms of coercion, of abduction, of fraud, of deception, of the abuse of power or of a position of vulnerability or of the giving or receiving of payments or benefits to achieve the consent of a person having control over another person, for the purpose of exploitation (Art. 3(a), UN Protocol to Prevent, Suppress and Punish Trafficking in Persons, Especially Women and Children, Supplementing the UN Convention against Transnational Organized Crime, 2000).

8. **Trafficking in human beings** – the recruitment, transportation, transfer, harbouring or receipt of persons, by means of the threat or use of force or other forms of coercion, of abduction, of fraud, of deception, of the abuse of power or of a position of vulnerability or of the giving or receiving of payments or benefits to achieve the consent of a person having control over another person, for the purpose of exploitation. Exploitation shall include, at a minimum, the exploitation of prostitution of others or other forms of sexual exploitation, forced labour or services, slavery or practices similar to slavery, servitude or the removal of organs (Art. 4 (a), Council of Europe Convention on Action against Trafficking, 2005).

9. **Child exploitation** – child exploitation includes: economic exploitation (any work that is likely to be hazardous or to interfere with the child’s education, or to be harmful to the child’s health or physical, mental, spiritual, moral or social development), sexual exploitation (sexual abuse,
prostitution, child’s pornography) and abduction of, sale of or trafficking in children, or any other forms of child exploitation (Conventional Rights of the Child, 1989; International Convention Concerning the Prohibition and Immediate Action for the Elimination of the Worst Forms of Child Labour, 1999).

10. Smuggling of migrants – the procurement, in order to obtain, directly or indirectly, financial or other material benefit from the illegal entry of a person into a State Party of which the person is not a national or a permanent resident (Art. 3 (a), UN Protocol against the Smuggling of Migrants by Land, Sea and Air, supplementing the United Nations Convention against Transnational Organized Crime, 2000).

11. Fraudulent travel or identity document – any travel or identity document:
   (i) That has been falsely made or altered in some material way by anyone other than a person or agency lawfully authorized to make or issue the travel or identity document on behalf of a State; or
   (ii) That has been improperly issued or obtained through misrepresentation, corruption or duress or in any other unlawful manner; or
   (iii) That is being used by a person other than the rightful holder (Art. 3 (c), UN Protocol against the Smuggling of Migrants by Land, Sea and Air, supplementing the United Nations Convention against Transnational Organized Crime, 2000).

12. Forced/compulsory labour – all work or service which is exacted from any person under the menace of any penalty and for which the said person has not offered himself/herself voluntarily (Art. 2(1), ILO Convention No. 29 on Forced Labour, 1930).

13. Tissue – a large mass of similar cells that make up a part of an organism and perform a specific function. The internal organs and connective structures (including bone and cartilage) of vertebrates, and cambium, xylem, and phloem in plants are made up of different types of tissue (The American Heritage Science Dictionary, 2010).

15. **Organ** – a distinct part of an organism that performs one or more specialized functions. Examples of organs are the eyes, ears, lungs, and heart of an animal, and the roots, stems, and leaves of a plant (*The American Heritage Science Dictionary*, 2010).

16. **Exploitation** – the act of taking advantage of something or someone, in particular the act of taking unjust advantage of another for one’s own benefit (e.g. sexual exploitation, forced labour or services, slavery or practices similar to slavery, servitude or the removal of organs) (Art. 3(a), *UN Protocol to Prevent, Suppress and Punish Trafficking in Persons, Especially Women and Children, Supplementing the UN Convention against Transnational Organized Crime*, 2000).

17. **Slavery** – the status or condition of a person over whom any or all the powers attaching to the right of ownership are exercised (Art. 1, *Slavery Convention*, 1926 as amended by 1953 *Protocol*). Slavery is identified by an element of ownership or control over another’s life, coercion and the restriction of movement and by the fact that someone is not free to leave or to change employer (e.g. traditional chattel slavery, bonded labour, serfdom, forced labour and slavery for ritual or religious purposes).
CASES OF HUMAN TRAFFICKING AND EXPLOITATION

“I shared a small room lacking basic amenities with six other persons. Nearly at all times we were starving: there were days when we had nothing to eat but some dry bread or cabbage stumps – sometimes we just starved. After working some eight months in such harsh conditions we learned that Mr. A. had not sent a single penny to our families though he swore on his late brother’s memory,” said Mr. R. K., a 42-year-old citizen of Gyumri.

On December 8, hearings on the criminal case against Mr. A. M. began in the First Instance Court of Shirak Region. He was accused of recruitment and exploitation of citizens R. and E. K and A. G. for more than one year in the city of Almetyevsk of the Republic of Tatarstan of the Russian Federation.

Before leaving for Tatarstan, Mr. R. worked on construction sites in the town of Tsakhkadzor. After the work was completed he returned to his home town of Gyumri. In December 2003, at the funeral of a relative, Mr. R. met his cousin, Mr. A., the son of his maternal aunt, and talked to him about his financial difficulties and unemployment. Mr. A. told him that one of his friends, a certain Mr. M., was recruiting a group of construction workers in Tatarstan, and they could go there together. Sometime later, Mr. A. came to see R. in his home to discuss details of the deal. During the conversation Mr. A. informed Mr. R. and his wife Mrs. H. K. that skilled workmen earned monthly RUB12,000 (USD400), and regular workers – RUB11,000 (USD300), and that USD50 would be deducted monthly to pay for their meals.

Mr. R. decided to take his 16-year-old son E. and his brother-in-law Mr. A. with him. “They offered good money for the job, and we have a big family with lots of problems (for example, our elder son is ill); as we were facing problems related to military service and higher education [of our children], I thought it quite reasonable to send our younger son to work together with R. My only condition was that E. should constantly work with R, and he agreed,” said Mrs. H.
Mr. A. declared that travel expenses were not covered by the company, and that the workers were expected to procure themselves the money they needed. He then assured the workers that after a maximum of 20 days from the date of their arrival they would be able to earn this money back. That is why Mr. R. and Mr. A. borrowed a sum of 300 dollars at interest and left for the Russian Federation on 25 April. On their arrival Mr. R. and Mr. A learned that they would work under Mr. A’s supervision and share a small room furnished only with beds in the village of Tikhsnab, situated not far from Almetyevsk with E. and some other workers.

“We had to start work at 7 o’clock, sometimes even at 6 o’clock in the morning. This was despite the fact that we had an agreement to work from 7/8 o’clock in the morning, as sometimes we used to return from work at 1 or 2 o’clock in the morning. Our food supply was awful. Once, I fell ill but Mr. A. neither bought me any medicine, nor called a doctor. If we asked for something he would answer that there was no money as we did a poor job. At the same time, he swore that our earnings were sent to our families,” said Mr. A.G.

After some time, under the pretext of making arrangements concerning their residence permits, A. took away their passports, declared that there was no more work to do, and sent them to work with another foreman. In June 2004, Mr. A. referred Mr. R. to the village of Nurlat without E. After working there for seven months Mr. R. returned to discover that E. was subjected to severe beatings.

The boy asked him for some money to call home and talk to his relatives. Instead of money, Mr. A. gave him a violent beating. Then Mr. A. gave the boy a broken cellular phone and promised to charge the account but did not keep his promise. Mr. A. was a heavy and violent drinker. There was no one we could complain to as he had good relations with the local police,” declared Mr. R. K at the trial.

On several occasions, Mr. A.G. was also beaten when he demanded his passport back for return home. For months, Mr. A. gained profit from the work of Mr. R. K. and Mr. A. G. by assigning
them to various construction parties and telling them that they had earned no remuneration from their employers as they had done a poor job.

In the meantime, Mrs. H. K. several times visited Mr. A’s family in Gyumri to learn some news about her husband: “They gave me a very cold reception and some rough treatment, telling me that they had no news whatsoever. On one occasion, immediately after I returned home from their place I got a call from Mr. A. who threatened and ordered me to stop annoying his family. Later, I spoke with R. to let him know that his father was ill, our elder son was taken to hospital and the interest on their debt was growing. I told him that we needed money to solve all these problems. R. was very surprised: he believed that his employers had been sending us the money he earned. Then he got confused and told me that everything would be fine and there was no need to complain. On another occasion, I got another menacing call from A. who warned me that if I disturbed his family again or reported him to the police, he would send my son’s head in a package”.

Despite these threats, which started from November 2004, Mrs. H. K. filed complaints to various authorities. Mr. R. K., his son E. and Mr. A. G. were declared wanted. Later, the complaints reached Moscow, and the competent authorities made inquiries in Tatarstan. In May 2005, the migration service of Tatarstan arrested Mr. R. and sent him to the capital city of Kazan’. While he was detained for two months in Kazan, his son E. and Mr. A. G. were also arrested. In July, Mr. R., his son E and Mr. A. G. returned to Armenia.

In the courtroom, Mr. A refused to answer any questions and insisted on the testimony he gave during the preliminary investigation. According to his testimony, Mr. R. K. deceived him by posing as skilled workman, although all the work he did drew complaints from employers. His son E. and Mr. A.G. also did poor work and, therefore, got no money. Claims of malnutrition and maltreatment were also false. Besides, Mr. A. declared that he had given workers some money; however, he could not prove it.
The court sentenced Mr. A. to imprisonment of 5 years and obliged him to pay Mr. R. K., his son E. and Mr. A.G. a sum of USD11,400.

An organization collaborating with the UMCOR charitable mission referred a young man aged 18 to their shelter. When interviewed the young man was identified as a victim of trafficking. Although seemingly unusual, his story is in many respects similar to those of other victims. When the boy was three years old his family moved to Yerevan. After his father died, his younger brother and sisters were sent to different orphanages. Later, the boy found himself in a special boarding school, where he lived in satisfactory conditions.

At the age of 17, the boy was placed in another orphanage, where he stayed for a year. In 2006, a foster mother visited the orphanage and took the boy away by promising him a comfortable apartment where he would have everything he needed. However, real life proved to be quite different. Upon reaching Yerevan, the boy discovered that the promised “apartment” was a cold cellar next to the waiting room of a hospital. There were no chairs or beds in the room; the only piece of furniture was a table. The boy had to sleep on the floor. His foster mother lived with her Russian friend. They both were jobless and drank a lot. Soon, they made the boy beg in the street and took away all the money he got. They even fixed the sum he was to bring daily at no less than 5000 drams. On the days he did not manage to collect the sum they required, the boy was severely beaten.

After beatings he used to run away, but was soon found and returned “home”. Once, as he refused to give away the money he had earned to his so-called parents scalded him with boiling water. A medical examination revealed that the boy’s body was covered with scorch marks and bruises. The boy was sick and tired of his beatings and begging. He learned from a friend about the Armenian Benevolent Union and went there for help. From there he was referred to the charitable organization UMCOR and was included in its assistance program. The boy wanted to become a tailor and shoemaker and to play the flute (once he used to play a little).
The boy received assistance under the programme implemented by the non-governmental organization UMCOR.

A male individual from a remote highland village working abroad offered a 16-year-old schoolboy from his village the opportunity to leave school and go with him abroad to work. The schoolboy accepted the offer and was employed by a private company. Weeks passed; then the boy understood that no one was going to pay him for his work. When he decided to quit his job and return to his home country, the armed security guard did not let him leave the territory of the company and said that the director had paid lots of money to bring him there. Thus, the boy could not quit the job unless he gave back the money. One year later, the boy still continued to work in the same conditions.

A young female student with an excellent academic record dreamed of continuing her studies in a famous university abroad. However, the girl’s parents lacked money to cover her tuition abroad. The girl had a well-to-do friend who offered her the chance to go abroad with him to work. She agreed but upon arriving in the country of destination she was forced to engage in prostitution.

A young girl worked as a waitress in a café. Soon after the café closed down, the girl came across one of her regular female customers in the street. The woman offered the young girl the opportunity to leave for Dubai, assuring her that there she would be able to find a well-paid job there in cafés or restaurants. The young girl accepted the offer. When she visited the recruiter at her home she met another woman who told her that it would be a lot easier to travel with several other girls. The recruiter covered the girl’s travel expenses and gave her another USD200 to leave with her family. Upon arriving in Dubai, the girls were taken to a small hotel and were told to get ready for their clients. The girl was very surprised to hear the word “client” as she had been promised a job as a waitress. The following day, the recruiter woman came to the hotel accompanied by an Arab man. The girls were told that he had purchased them and therefore could act as he wished, and that they could not refuse to obey or follow his orders. The girls were in his country, and whatever happened, there was no way police and migration authorities would believe them or respond
to their complaints. From that day on, the girl’s life turned really sour...

After losing her husband, a mother of four children took on full care of her family. She did not manage to find a job in Armenia. One of her neighbours, who was also seeking a job, told her that she knew many people who had found employment in Turkey through an agency dealing with bus transportation. Both women left together for Turkey, went to the company and found a man there who was already waiting for them. He offered them a job at the canteen of a company with a weekly salary of USD200 and 10 working hours per day. By the end of their first week, the women asked the company director to pay their wages. He answered that they had to work more and their preliminary contracts were to be reviewed. The following week, the women again received no payment. By the end of the second month, the director paid them USD100 after their multiple requests. Sometime later, the woman got a call from Yerevan and learned that her son was ill and needed money for treatment. She requested again to be paid her salary; however the director threatened that he would report her to the migration authorities for working past the expiry date of her entry visa.

Two young friends spent a lot of time looking for a job. Finally, one of them read an advertisement about a very lucrative job in Spain. They left for Spain through an employment agency which had placed an advertisement in the newspaper. Upon their arrival, the young men were immediately taken to a farm to pick oranges. On the very first day, they signed a contract with the company. As it was drawn in a foreign language and the young men signed the contract without understanding it and guessed their salary would be EUR250. The next day, their labour began. The young men toiled in extremely harsh living conditions. They worked 12-15 hours a day and got no money unless they collected the daily norm of 27 boxes. They lived in a damp, dilapidated room without any windows, wardrobe, chairs or facilities. They had to wait for their turn to use the bathroom. Representatives of the agency promised them fast income but the young men could not even imagine that they would be so quickly exhausted and would not earn enough money to return home.
BIBLIOGRAPHY

INTERNATIONAL AND NATIONAL INSTRUMENTS

9. RA Governmental Decree of on Approving the National Programme against Human Trafficking for 2010-2012 and the Programme Schedule (3 September 2010).
10. RA Governmental Decree on Approving the National Referral Mechanism for Victims of Trafficking (20 November 2008).

---

1. CS research papers: Արձակին Մ., Գ. Ղազինյանի խմբագրությամբ, Երևան, ԵՊՀ հրատարակչություն, 2007:
2. Արձակին Մ., Գ. Ղազինյանի խմբագրությամբ, Երևան, ԵՊՀ հրատարակչություն, 2005:
3. Արձակին Մ., Գ. Ղազինյան խմբագրությամբ, Երևան, ԵՊՀ հրատարակչություն, 2006:
4. Արձակին Մ., Գ. Ղազինյան խմբագրությամբ, Երևան, ԵՊՀ հրատարակչություն, 2007:
5. Մ. Անտոնյան, Ա. Սահակյան, Թրաֆիքի դեմ պայքարը համայնքներում. Ձեռնարկ ՀԿ-ի համար, Երևան, ՄՄԿ, 2006:
6. Ս. Պետրոսյան, Ռ. Մուրադյան, Ս. Խաչատրյան, Հ. Խաչատրյան, Կ. Նահապետյան Թրաֆիքինգ (մարդկանց շահագործում), Ձեռնարկ սովորողների համար, ՄՄԿ, Երևան, 2010:
7. Մ. Անտոնյան, Ա. Սահակյան, Թրաֆիքի դեմ պայքարը համայնքներում. Ձեռնարկ ուսանողների համար: Եր., 2005:
8. Գ. Շահինյան, Վ. Ավակովա, Թրաֆիքինգի կանխարգելում և աջակցություն զոհերին: Ձեռնարկ “Զբաղվածության պետական ծառայություն” և սոցիալական ծառայության տարածվածության զարգացմանցարդյունական համար, Եր., 2004:
9. Դ. Սասունյան, Ա. Սարյան, Թրաֆիքինգի կանխարգելում և աջակցություն կիրառման զարգացման աջակցության և ծառայության զարգացման կերպարվեստ, Եր., 2009:
10. Ցիվինսկի դեմ պայքարն և շահագործում Հայաստանում, գեղազարդական թզակերպ հանդիսանքի և կանոնավոր հրապարակությունների կետանկանության, Եր., 2009:
11. Դ. Սղումյան և Ֆ. Բաբկին ազգերենի և շահազատելիքի ծառայություններ: Սոցիալական զարգացման պայքարը և պահպանություն, Եր., 2005:
12. Մ. Մելքոնյան, Ա. Սարգսյան, Թ. Տիգրանյան, Քանականից իրավունքների գործունեության արժեքացում, Եր., 2007:
13. Криминология/Под ред.В.Н.Кудрявцева.Москва, Юрист, 2002г.ст.279-280
14. Марион Паюметс, Тийу Лаан: Торговля людьми: методология работы с молодежью, Copyright International Organization for Migration, 2005
15. Мизулина Е.Б. Торговля людьми и рабство в России, М. 2006.
31. Judiciary Portal www.datalex.am
BIBLIOGRAPHY ON INTERACTIVE TEACHING METHODS

- U. Թարգերյան, U. Նայիսկհայաց և նիրկերրել, Հասարակագիտական ուսուցման զուգակցություն: Ուսուցիչների քնարակի նորմա և սպասող բնագագիտական գրավառություն, ՀԱՅՐԵՔՍ, Երևան, Լուսաբաց, 2006:

- U.Նայիսկհայաց, U. Թարգերյան և այլն, Հասարակագիտական ուսուցման զուգակցություն: Ուսուցիչների զուգակցություն, ՀԱՅԱՐԵՔՍ, Երևան, Տիգրան Մեծ, 2005:

- U.Նայիսկհայաց, U. Թարգերյան և այլն, Հասարակագիտական ուսուցման զուգակցություն: Ուսուցիչների զուգակցություն, ՀԱՅՐԵՔՍ, Երևան, Տիգրան Մեծ, 2005:

- U.Նայիսկհայաց, U. Թարգերյան և այլն, Հասարակագիտական ուսուցման զուգակցություն: Ուսուցիչների զուգակցություն, ՀԱՅԻՐԵՔՍ, Երևան, Տիգրան Մեծ, 2005:

- U.Նայիսկհայաց, U. Թարգերյան և այլն, Հասարակագիտական ուսուցման զուգակցություն: Ուսուցիչների զուգակցություն, ՀԱՅԻՐԵՔՍ, Երևան, Տիգրան Մեծ, 2005:

- U.Նայիսկհայաց, U. Թարգերյան և այլն, Հասարակագիտական ուսուցման զուգակցություն: Ուսուցիչների զուգակցություն, ՀԱՅԻՐԵՔՍ, Երևան, Տիգրան Մեծ, 2005:

- U.Նայիսկհայաց, U. Թարգերյան և այլն, Հասարակագիտական ուսուցման զուգակցություն: Ուսուցիչների զուգակցություն, ՀԱՅԻՐԵՔՍ, Երևան, Տիգրան Մեծ, 2005:

- U.Նայիսկհայաց, U. Թարգերյան և այլն, Հասարակագիտական ուսուցման զուգակցություն: Ուսուցիչների զուգակցություն, ՀԱՅԻՐԵՔՍ, Էդիթ պրինտ, էջ 88-94:

- Ս.Խաչատրյան, Ս.Պետրոսյան և այլն, Քաղաքացիական կրթություն. ժողովրդական հիմնարդարական արժեքներ: ԱՅՌԵՔՍ, Երևան, 2004, էջ 88-94:

- Ս.Խաչատրյան, Ս.Պետրոսյան և այլն, Քաղաքացիական կրթություն. ժողովրդական հիմնարդարական արժեքներ: ԱՅՌԵՔՍ, Երևան, 2004, էջ 88-94:

- Ս.Խաչատրյան, Ս.Պետրոսյան և այլն, Քաղաքացիական կրթություն. ժողովրդական հիմնարդարական արժեքներ: ԱՅՌԵՔՍ, Երևան, 2004, էջ 88-94:


- Morris, V.R., (2001), Drama and authentic assessment in a social

- http://www.justicelearning.org
- http://student-voices.org
- http://eycb.coe.int/compass/ru
CASE RECORDS AND COVERAGE OF HUMAN TRAFFICKING IN MASS MEDIA

As many articles have been dedicated to the subject of trafficking, it is more expedient to reference websites only. Follow the links below and type ‘trafficking’ in the search bar and press “Enter”. A new window will open to show titles of all the articles related to trafficking:

1. Hetq online: www.hetq.am
2. Aravot: www.aravot.am
3. Hayots Ashkharh: www.armworld.am
4. Yerkir: http://www.yerkir.am
5. Hayastani Hanrapetutyun: http://www.hhpress.am

List of documentary and feature films related to human trafficking and slavery

An updated list of documentaries and feature films related to the topic of human trafficking and exploitation can be found on the website: http://humantrafficking.wordpress.com/human-trafficking-movies/

http://www.state.gov/documents/organization/195802
Բնակավարձքի մակարդակ
Համազգային

Գիտական սառը հետազոտություն
ուսումնական
և երկարատև համագործակցություն